

Problem for 2016 September

Communicated by Dan Jurca

This problem appeared on the internet. Prove the following proposition.

If

- a is a positive integer, and
- b is a positive integer, and
- $ab + 1$ divides $a^2 + b^2$,

then $\frac{a^2 + b^2}{ab + 1}$ is a perfect square.

Solution by Dan Jurca

Suppose a is an integer, b is an integer, and $ab + 1$ divides $a^2 + b^2$. If $q = (a^2 + b^2)/(ab + 1)$, then obviously q equals a square if either a or b equals 0; and if $a = b$, then

$$q = \frac{a^2 + b^2}{ab + 1} = \frac{2a^2}{a^2 + 1} = 2 - \frac{2}{a^2 + 1} < 2,$$

and since q equals a nonnegative integer, $q = 0$ or $q = 1$, so q is a square. Thus we may and do assume from now on that $0 < a < b$, $ab + 1$ divides $a^2 + b^2$, and $q = (a^2 + b^2)/(ab + 1)$.

Let $a' = qa - b$ and $b' = a$. Then a' is an integer, b' is an integer, and

$$0 < a < b \Rightarrow a^3 < a^2b \Rightarrow a^3 + ab^2 < a^2b + ab^2 + a + b \Rightarrow a(a^2 + b^2) < (ab + 1)(a + b) \Rightarrow qa < a + b \Rightarrow a' < b'.$$

Thus $a' < b' = a$, so $a' < a$; and $b' = a < b$; *i.e.*, $a' < a$ and $b' < b$. Moreover

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{(a')^2 + (b')^2}{a'b' + 1} &= \frac{q^2a^2 - 2qab + b^2 + a^2}{qa^2 - ab + 1} = \frac{q^2a^2 - qab + q + a^2 + b^2 - qab - q}{qa^2 - ab + 1} \\ &= \frac{q(qa^2 - ab + 1) + [(a^2 + b^2) - q(ab + 1)]}{qa^2 - ab + 1} = q \frac{qa^2 - ab + 1}{qa^2 - ab + 1} + 0 \\ &= q. \end{aligned}$$

(If $a'b' = -1$, then $a' = -1$ and $b' = 1 = a$; but then $a' = qa - b = q - b = -1$, so $q = (1^2 + b^2)/(b + 1) = b - 1$, but $b^2 + 1 \neq b^2 - 1$, so this does not occur; *i.e.*, $a'b' + 1 \neq 0$.)

If one iterates this (with a' in place of a and b' in place of b) one obtains decreasing sequences of integral a 's and b 's, but always $(a^2 + b^2)/(ab + 1) = q$. Now suppose that $0 < a < b$, but $a' \leq 0$; we will show that in fact then $a' = 0$. (That is, a is the last strictly positive term in the sequence of iterates, and the next term, a' , is less than or equal to 0.) Then, as observed above, q equals a square.

So suppose $0 < a < b$, $(a^2 + b^2)/(ab + 1) = q$ is a positive integer, but $a' = qa - b \leq 0$. If $a = 1$, then $q = (1 + b^2)/(b + 1)$; but b is a positive integer and

$$q = \frac{b^2 + 1}{b + 1} = b - 1 + \frac{2}{b + 1}$$

and this is an integer if and only if $b = 1$, and since $a < b$, we have $b \neq 1$. Thus $1 < a$. But then since $b' = a$, it follows that $1 < b'$. Hence if $a' \leq -1$, then $a'b' < -1$, so that $a'b' + 1 < 0$, and $q = ((a')^2 + (b')^2)/(a'b' + 1) < 0$, a contradiction. Therefore $-1 < a'$, and since $a' \leq 0$, it follows that $a' = 0$, and $q = (b')^2 = a^2$ is a square.

Remark. One can produce all such a and b as follows.

Let n be an integer, and consider sequences $(a_k)_{k=0}^{\infty}$ and $(b_k)_{k=0}^{\infty}$ as follows.

$$a_0 = 0, \quad b_0 = n; \quad 1 \leq k \Rightarrow a_k = b_{k-1}, \quad b_k = n^2 b_{k-1} - a_{k-1}$$

Then $0 \leq k \Rightarrow \frac{a_k^2 + b_k^2}{a_k b_k + 1} = n^2$. Moreover, if a and b are positive integers and $ab + 1$ divides $a^2 + b^2$, then there exist n and k such that $a = a_k$ and $b = b_k$ where (a_k) and (b_k) are the sequences defined above.

Also solved by Benjamin Thomas