Hope, Family, and Possibility:  
A Collaborative Program Evaluation  
Photovoice Project  

Network for Social Work Management Conference  
June 5, 2014, Boston, MA  

Sarah Taylor,  MSW, PhD, Assistant Professor of Social Work  
Danielle Pizzi, MSW Candidate 2014  
Nick Crispino, MSW Candidate 2014  
Vincente Mozell, MSW Candidate 2014  

Acknowledgments  
This activity was sponsored by: The  
California Arts Council and National Arts and Disability Center at the University of California Los Angeles and the CSU East Bay  
Department of Social Work  

Many thanks to:  
Shannon Jurich, Ron Luter, Richard Fitzmaurice, and Dr. Terry Jones
Agenda

1. Introduction and Background
   • Program evaluation
   • The Arc of Alameda County
   • Photovoice process
2. Participant Photography
3. Small Group Activity
4. Analysis
5. Tips for Implementation
6. Questions

“Research seeks to **prove**, evaluation seeks to **improve**…”

*M.Q. Patton*
What is the Arc of Alameda County?

- Non-profit organization in the Bay Area of California
- The Arc provides services and programs for people with intellectual/developmental disabilities (I/DD).
- The Arc currently operates from four locations in Alameda County – Hayward, San Leandro, Union City, and Livermore.
- Offers a range of programs such as supportive day treatment, vocational development, and job placement.
Arc of Alameda County: Mission and Values

The Mission of The Arc of Alameda County is to provide **advocacy**, **support**, and **education** to persons with intellectual and developmental disabilities and their families throughout Alameda County.

The Arc achieves its mission of serving individuals with I/DD:

- By assuring they are valued, respected, and included in all **communities**.
- By assisting them in **choosing their services and supports** from many available sources.
- By **empowering them** through nonprofit advocacy, and assuring that State and Federal governments administer programs and set budgets that meet everyone’s needs.

- Arc of Alameda County, [www.arcalameda.org](http://www.arcalameda.org)

---

### Project Implementation: SWOT Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Favorable</th>
<th>Internal</th>
<th>External</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **STRENGTHS** | - Breadth of services  
- The Arc owns half of the campus properties (financial security)  
- Ability to customize services to each client  
- Strong volunteer base | **OPPORTUNITIES** | - Strong partnerships with Regional Center of the East Bay (RCEB)  
- Partnerships with companies (for client jobs) and other community-based organizations  
- Diversified funding stream |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unfavorable</th>
<th>Internal</th>
<th>External</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **WEAKNESSES** | - Organizational need for marketing, PR  
- Majority of funding comes from one source (Regional Center of the East Bay, RCEB)  
- Need for capacity building in internal evaluations, maintenance of client demographics, etc. | **THREATS** | - Funding cuts  
- Increase in regulations and policies, requiring additional staff to oversee and implement  
- Volunteer base potentially unsustainable |
What is Photovoice?

- Developed by Caroline Wang at the University of Michigan and Mary Ann Burris at the Ford Foundation (Beijing, China) in 1992
  - Their goal: To provide a forum for rural Chinese women to share their experiences through photography as a way to influence programs and policies that affected them

- Since then, it has been used with a wide variety of marginalized populations

- It is considered to be a participatory action research strategy
  - It can facilitate involvement of staff, consumers, and family members in a meaningful program evaluation effort

Why Photovoice for the Arc?

- A participatory method to provide the Arc’s consumers’ a voice in the experiences and services they receive

- To develop photography skills and have an opportunity to share their work in a formal public exhibition

- As a program evaluation – To provide qualitative research that shows how the agency’s mission and values are reflected in the participants’ photographs
Project Implementation: Logic Model

### Inputs
- Site of Walpert site to conduct meetings
- Cameras/cameras for taking photos
- Consent forms/release of information forms for participants
- Funding for picture enlargement, frames, refreshments, etc., for public exhibition

### Outputs
- Participants
  - Activities
    - Short-term
      - Participants will be able to enjoy taking pictures
      - Participants will learn basic photography techniques
      - Exhibition – Celebrate Disability Awareness Month
    - Medium-term
      - Participants will learn to form narratives about their photographs
      - Participants will be able to form narratives about their photographs
      - Final exhibition (Walpert site or CSUEB)
      - Staff to management on the impact of The Arc program
    - Long-term
      - Empowering consumers to express their thoughts and engaging personal narratives through digital photography
      - Enhanced community awareness, engagement in action, and advocacy

### Outcomes
- Assumptions
  1. Participant fidelity will last throughout the entire course of the research project.
  2. The team will be able to find a venue for public exhibition of photographs once research is complete.
  3. Staff will remain supportive during our project.

### External Factors
- Participant may choose to withdraw from research project.
- Participant may get injured/distracted during project.
- Family/guardian/friends may refuse interview.

### Project Implementation

- The Photovoice participants (11) began meeting with the research team in January, 2014.

- Facilitated by Sarah Taylor (Research Leader), Danielle Pizzi (Research Assistant), Vincente Mozell (Research Assistant), and Nick Crispino (Research Assistant), with support from Frank Alvarado (Rehabilitation Coordinator) and Renee Tuttle (Walpert Site Supervisor)

- One-hour meetings occurred once a week from January – April, 2014 at the Walpert site in Hayward, CA.
  - Approximately 10 meetings
Project Implementation

• Participatory process:
  • The artists made all decisions about themes and took all of their own photos

• Meetings included:
  • Hands-on assistance in learning how to operate cameras
  • Sharing of photography tips
  • Discussion of ethics and safety when taking photographs.
  • Sharing and discussing photographs, selecting works for the exhibition, and writing brief narratives
  • Preparing for the Photovoice exhibit at CSUEB on May 19 2014

Example of group meeting in February 2014
Photovoice exhibit at CSUEB on May 19, 2014

Participant Photography
Artists

Alex Garza
Don Juan Pierson
Donna Warren
Elsa DeCoito
Joe Payne
Jose Luis Maldonado
Julie Reyes
Keri Jones
Marquis Sessoms
Michael Vasquez
Sulma Ruiz

He’s nice. I play with him. He makes me happy. His name is CoCo.
- Sulma Ruiz
He is happy. He’s funny. I love him. He always hugs me and says, “Don’t be sad.”
- Sulma Ruiz

This is my grandfather. He was very nice to me. I miss him really badly.
- Sulma Ruiz
His name is Dennis the Menace. He likes to meow. When he meows, it means he wants me to pet him and play with him.
- Donna Warren

These are pictures of my cousin, Elsa & her niece, and a picture of me and my son.
- Donna Warren
My dog’s name is Gabby Johnston. She’s really friendly. She likes to eat. She eats what we eat. She acts more like a human to me. She loves attention from everybody, except the mailman. She doesn’t like the mailman. She acts like a guard dog. She barks when people come over. She doesn’t like guys in uniforms. On Friday to Sunday nights, she sleeps in my bed. She tries to take over.

- Donna Warren

This is Walpert Center. This is where we do art, crafts, all different kinds of things.

- Keri Jones
We go into this house to have cooking class and have fun.
- Keri Jones

This is Scherry’s garden. They like to plant greens.
- Keri Jones
Family is always united no matter what.
- Jose Luis Maldonado
*Original artist – Miguel Diaz

Hope to travel and find and live in my country someday.
- Jose Luis Maldonado
*Original artist – Miguel Diaz
Family. My big “TIGER.” He makes me feel happy. My best friend in whom I trust.
- Jose Luis Maldonado

This reminds me of my step-father. His name is Sonny. I was his only one only son. He brought me a dog when I was younger and blind. I have it in my heart.
– Don Juan Pierson
This is family and hope. He's a father, a grandfather, and a singer. He private, and doesn’t tell his business when he’s singing.

– Don Juan Pierson

This is for the family. This makes me think of when I am singing a song by Elton John called “Don’t Let the Sun Go Down On Me”

– Don Juan Pierson
Life and death
- Alex Garza

Nature and steel
- Alex Garza
Hidden in the sky
- Alex Garza

I like this picture because she is nice and my friend.
She makes me laugh.
- Elsa DeCoito
I like flowers. I like to look at them when they grow into something beautiful.
- Elsa DeCoito

I like this picture because I can stand up straight. And because I'm not falling down.
- Elsa DeCoito
I like my daddy. He is a nice guy. He got married to my mom. He likes my mom, my sister, and me. I love my daddy and miss him so much.

- Joe Payne

One time when I saw her, she was really, really little. She barks a lot because she doesn’t want people to get near me. She protects me.

- Joe Payne
This is Mr. Nelson. He is nice. He makes me feel better. He gives me presents during Christmas.
- Joe Payne

She is a great mom, and she helps me a lot
- Julie Reyes
I like to shop because I can pick my own clothes  
- Julie Reyes

Its really nice to look it, and it relaxes me.  
- Julie Reyes
I want to make this one day
-Marquis Sessoms

I want to fly to different places
-Marquis Sessoms
This is my dad’s workshop. He fixes cars.
- Marquis Sessoms

I wanted to see the bridge one last time before it goes away
- Michael Vasquez
It’s a “family” of deer  
- Michael Vasquez

I think it feels like in the future we'll never lose it because it’s a strong bridge. It’s a view of future possibilities.  
- Michael Vasquez
Photo Analysis Exercise

• In small groups of about 5 people:
  – Look at the photographs your group has been given.
  – For each photograph, use the SHOWeD guideline to illuminate themes:
    • What do you See here?
    • What is really Happening here?
    • How does this relate to Our lives?
    • Why does this situation, concern, or strength exist?
    • What can we Do about it?
  – Please take notes and be prepared to share them in the large group and with the presenters!


Data Collection

• Data sets included
  1. Participant photography
  2. Photo narratives
  3. Documentation of group processes
  4. Family/friend interview transcripts

• Each data set was coded by researchers using themes drawn from the organization’s mission statement.
## Findings: Theme Codebook

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Definition</th>
<th>Example</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Independence</td>
<td>The promotion of individuality and to have the freedom and ability to make one's own choices.</td>
<td>&quot;I like to shop because I can pick my own clothes.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community</td>
<td>To be included in all communities throughout the Bay Area</td>
<td>&quot;Every time I walk around with my cane and every time they see me they stop to lick my hand.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advocacy</td>
<td>Support and encouragement for consumers' rights.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access</td>
<td>The removal of barriers for consumers.</td>
<td>&quot;I just like to go out in the van because we can go shopping, go to the zoo, and other fun stuff.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support</td>
<td>To provide emotional and systemic support.</td>
<td>&quot;This is Mr. Roger. He’s a nice guy. He washes dishes and cleans up for us. He dances with me. When I cry sometimes, he gives me a hug and tells me not to worry.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>To teach and help consumers learn new things.</td>
<td>&quot;This is the garden. I like to learn to be like the gardening people.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation</td>
<td>To participate and contribute as active citizens in the community.</td>
<td>&quot;This American flag was given to me by one of my bosses at the blind center in Oakland. I was employee at the blind center, I used to be a greeter.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>To be valued by the Arc and all other communities.</td>
<td>&quot;And that’s good. Friends are family. That’s wonderful. Anybody can be family.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empowerment</td>
<td>To provide strength for others.</td>
<td>&quot;Uhh, I liked the way everybody explained the project pictures. And uh, how they feel about it. And if they were comfortable doing it or something like that. Or sharing about their families. I think it’s a good thing for everybody to express about the photos that they took. It’s okay, but you know, it’s alright. Share with your friends. Maybe the next day, in the future, somebody else will want to try it.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationships</td>
<td>The promotion of love and happiness.</td>
<td>&quot;One time when I saw her, she was really, really little. She barks a lot because she doesn’t want people to get near me. She protects me.&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Hope     | Desires, life goals, possibilities                                | "I want to fly to different places."                                                     

## Findings: Theme Prevalence

![Narrative Frequency Chart](https://example.com/narrative_frequency_chart.png)
Findings

- Participant photos and narratives demonstrated a feeling of connectedness and community within the Arc Walpert center.

- Photos and narratives depicted strong relationships, sense of community, and independence outside of Arc community.
Findings

• Numerous photographs of education and recreation in the Arc Walpert facility (photo of vans that take them on outings, photos of Walpert Center garden) indicating satisfaction with Arc services.

• In analyzing group discussions, some participants reported feeling disconnected or unable to access parts of recreational services – this could indicate a fragmentation of services to be addressed.

• Though advocacy is a core theme in the organization’s mission statement, advocacy themes were generally not present in participants’ photographs.

Tips for Implementing Program Evaluations Using PhotoVoice

Conduct a Needs Assessment
• What are the organization’s reported strengths and weaknesses?
• What is the organization’s stated mission and goals?
• Annual reports, staff interviews, organization materials and literature

Review literature and past research to identify policies, care models, and effective programming currently used with the population of interest.
• What has been shown to be effective?
• What do we already know about this population?

Design project in collaboration with organization
• Take population vulnerability into account and submit proposals to Institutional Review Boards to map out ethical practices.
• Develop a calendar and meeting agendas
• Seek feedback and insight from organizational partners

Use organization’s stated mission and values to analyze your data
• How is efficacy of the mission and values demonstrated in the participant’s art?
• What are common themes in the photography and narratives?
Next Steps

• Continued analysis of photographs
• Possible second exhibition at the Arc Walpert campus and/or other community-based locations
• Possible continuation of the project at the Arc’s other campuses

Contact Information

• Sarah Taylor, MSW, PhD, Assistant Professor, CSU East Bay, Hayward, CA sarah.taylor@csueastbay.edu
• Danielle Pizzi, MSW Candidate, daniellepizzi@gmail.com
• Nick Crispino, MSW Candidate, ncrispino@gmail.com
• Vincente Mozell, MSW Candidate, mozell94577@yahoo.com