ILO Collaboration, Teamwork, and Leadership rubric description

Rubric Description: Working with others is an essential component of our university experience. Students work in teams on classroom assignments, on service learning projects, in student organizations, in campus service departments and elsewhere on campus with each of these providing a possible context for rubric application. Leading, collaborating with others, and working in teams comprised of diverse members is vital in our workplaces and communities.

Why faculty developed this guide

This guide was developed as an elective resource by and for cross-disciplinary faculty and students to support our efforts toward crafting assignments that help students demonstrate their achievement of the Institutional Learning Outcome of Collaboration, Teamwork, and Leadership (CTL) as it applies to our disciplines and programs.

Typically, ILOs such as CTL are assessed using aligned coursework as mapped though the ILO - PLO curriculum maps. Opportunities for students to demonstrate CTL exist beyond individual courses and can be captured through a variety of activities outside of the classroom and credit-bearing classes (e.g., co-curricular activities, student organizations and clubs, student assistant leadership positions on campus). This guide has been developed to include suggestions on how to integrate both curricular and co-curricular activities so they can also be assessed by the ILO of CTL.
Considerations when designing ILO CTL assignments

- Some of these ideas may fit with your course whether or not your class has a Student Learning Outcome that aligns with this ILO.
- The assignment need not include all categories in the rubric.
- Recognize that there are many different ways of leading, collaborating and working in a team, and that there are many ways for students to demonstrate these skills such as leading through mutual support and collaboration both in and out of the classroom.
- Recognize that the way students may develop and change over time in regards to leading, collaborating, and working in a team will differ. Students will have different “paths.”
- Design assignments in a variety of formats (e.g., written product, visual product) as students express their learning best in different ways.
- Provide a variety of learning tools to be equitable and to recognize different experiences of students, including the various ways that students learn, develop, and grow. Some of these tools include self-assessments, self-reflection, early stated expectations, agreement on deadlines, open-ended discussion starters, and discussions about how to meet the needs of group members.
- Select assignments that relate to students’ real-life experiences and contemporary issues such as social justice.

Considerations for integrating co-curricular student experiences into ILO CTL Assignments

Co-curricular defined: For the purpose of this guide, co-curricular and extracurricular is defined as activities, programs, and experiences that happen outside of the classroom. This could be formal such as being in a club, working as a student assistant, participating in a program that supports student success, or participating in a disciplinary program experience outside the classroom. This might also be less formal such as attending a campus event or using a campus service. In many of these experiences, students are building CTL skills which can be integrated into classroom experiences and assignments.

- Help students to make connections that their learning and skill development happens both in and outside the classroom.
- Consider integrating both informal and the formal (e.g. in a trained student assistant leadership role) co-curricular learning that occurs on campus into assignments/reflection papers.
- It can be helpful for students to self-assess in co-curricular work which can be integrated into a reflection assignment.
- Consider reflection assignments for progressive leadership co-curricular experiences such as starting as a student assistant then progressing into a student leadership position.
What students say best supports classroom learning for collaboration, teamwork, and leadership

This section summarizes input from students writing this guide and from focus group discussions with student resident assistants from Student Housing and Residence Life and from student assistants from Wellness Services, April 2021.

- **Objectives/agreements**: Establish project and assignment objectives that encourage students to voice how they want to be supported when working collaboratively; provide a reliable set of forms of communication approaches to utilize when working with one another (ex. text, groupme, email, Facetime, Zoom); consider creating a conceptual map that illustrates a step-by-step process on how each member works collaboratively to achieve the end-goal; help students establish working agreements when working in groups such as setting expectations for individual work and addressing challenges.

- **Introductions**: Provide student groups with introductory activities before starting work to get to know each other, become more comfortable, and build trust.

- **Structure and flexibility**: Build in both structure and flexibility. Examples of helpful structure include clarifying student roles in CTL, and providing schedules with benchmarks. Examples of flexibility include checking in and listening to students and needs of groups to see how things are working and make adjustments as needed to curriculum and student projects.

- **Diversity of students**: Make it clear in syllabus, class introduction, and throughout the course that diversity extends to different experiences and styles which are valued in the classroom, workforce, and other settings.

- **Diversity of assignments**: Provide different types of assignments that are representative of diverse styles of learning and backgrounds.

- **Equity**: Consider collaborative activities that include equitable roles for all students.

- **Connection between Instructor and student**: Learn how to pronounce student names by asking; validate the feelings and experiences of all students.

- **Instructor support**: At the start of a class session, ask how students are doing; visit each group during class to see what is going on and to offer help which can feel more personal and accessible than asking questions as a full class; let students know that it is okay to ask questions and to question something.

- **Accountability**: When grading students on their work in groups, include assessments for individual contribution as well as the overall group contribution.

- **Hands-on work**: Build in hand’s-on work for students to apply CTL concepts and ask them to reflect on how they worked.

- **Peer-to-peer leadership**: Provide peer-to-peer leadership and learning opportunities by having student volunteers facilitate segments of learning in small groups.
**Examples of assignment tips and instructions across disciplines**

The table below provides suggestions for developing assignments for each of the ILO CTL categories, applicable across disciplines. The left-hand column contains tips and guiding questions for developing assignments. The right-hand column contains example prompts that can be developed into assignments.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>This column contains the definition of the rubric category, tips and guiding questions when designing an assignment</th>
<th>This column contains examples of language and approaches that instructors might use in the assignment.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Considerations for developing assignments focused on “Social skills”**  
Skills used to communicate and interact with others. | **Example assignment instructions/prompts for “Social skills”** |
| Below are some social, cognitive, behavioral and emotional competencies:  
- Patience; understanding; empathy; appropriate body language; feedback (active listening); tone and expression; delegation skills; persuasion skills; differentiating self from others; ability to see all perspectives; sympathy; negotiation; open-mindedness; flexibility; trust; vulnerability; egolessness; honesty.  
- Awareness of implicit bias, valuing input and contributions;  
- Making a conscious effort to bring everyone into the conversation.  
**Tips for “Social skills”**  
- Help students develop their skills for showing empathy and compassion for others through actively listening and asking open-ended questions. | **General Examples for assignment instructions for “Social skills”**  
- Practice disagreement by writing a statement of a particular position/view on a card and having a classmate advocate for the opposite view. Disagree respectfully based on your beliefs without putting the other person on the defensive. Acknowledge their position avoiding negative qualifiers like “but,” “however.”  
- Share your personality type and use that to determine how to work with one another (e.g., regarding schedules and planning; style of communication, being inclusive).  
- Have a class discussion about how to deal with members who don’t do their work in a group. Should group members tell the professor/work supervisor about the unproductive member? It’s generally hard for students to tell faculty about this situation (“ratting out” a fellow student). There may be a way for individual members in a group to document their process. Is it a good idea to be able to report out about a student in an anonymous way to the professor? But there should be a safety mechanism so that the student isn’t unfairly treated. |
• Determine which social skills may be most appropriate and relevant given the class.
• Inform students of the importance of communicating with each other.
• Provide awareness of each other's personalities; provide opportunity for quieter students to join in and let them know you care about their contribution.
• Instruct students how to gather input in groups that move towards the goal without shutting down input.
• Provide balance between reflective silence and active participation from each member. Be okay with quiet space.
• Use ice breakers to work on specific skills.
• When someone is having a bad day and brings that emotion to the group, suggest they communicate that to their group members.

**Discipline Specific Examples for “Social skills”**

- **Kinesiology/Physical Education:** Have students design lesson plans to teach a certain skill and teach it to the class.
- **Kinesiology/Social Work/Speech Therapy/Recreation:** Conduct simulations on presenting fitness assessment results to clients.
- **Psychology/Communication/Social Work/Kinesiology:** Lecture about non-verbal communication then practice in pairs. Next, provide feedback to each other.

**Guiding Questions for developing assignments focused on “Social skills”**

- What are the 'key' social skills given the context?
- Which social skills are in alignment with your class learning outcomes?
- How do social skills look in practice?
- Does the assignment allow the opportunity for all students to be heard?
- Are all group members’ contributions essential to the outcome? Do the members have balanced roles in the assignment?
- Does the assignment provide guidance to students about how to work together without forming “cliques” that may exclude others?
- Are you encouraging students to encourage each other to participate?
- Have you considered how to keep students engaged in the collaborative process (e.g., how to discourage students from “checking out”?)
Considerations for developing assignments focused on “Accountability”

Accepts responsibility and contributes to the team goals.

- Consider how you hold students accountable in class activities that involve group work.
- Help students see ways to distribute tasks/roles within the work based on their preferred styles.
- Check in with everyone in the team about what is delegated to each person and how to create a caring, collaborative group process.
- Recognize that being accountable to others can make some people feel anxious. Anxiety can be paralyzing, leading the person not to fulfill the task for which they were responsible, and thereby, confirming their worst fears about being part of a team.

**Tips for “Accountability”**

- Ensure students all have a role/all roles essential to the outcome.
- Make contributions measurable with deadlines.
- Break down tasks into manageable goals.
- Team building and team spirit are “preventative medicine” for a lack of accountability. People naturally feel accountable to those to whom they feel a strong sense of connection.
- Begin each group meeting with a progress update on tasks. If a group member is falling behind, other group members could ask how the group can

**Example assignment instructions/prompts for “Accountability”**

**General Examples for assignment instructions for “Accountability”**

- Have a group assignment specify how students will identify their roles, how responsibilities will be divided up, deadlines, quality expectations, and how they will be held accountable.
- Assessment: Circulate an anonymous form in which group members can score their fellow group members on a scale of 1 to 10 in terms of the quality of their participation in the group. Part of each group member’s grade will be the average of the score that they were given by their fellow group members.
- Assign a complex task to different groups in real time, then discuss which process they chose, and how it created accountability (or not).
- Without direct instructor observation of the project, identify how students will document their sense of accountability (personal reflection; team feedback; etc.)

**Discipline Specific Examples for “Accountability”**

- **Economics:** Connect theory of incentives to observed real-world practices; identify how to design incentives for real-world problems, who is accountable for which outcome, and in what way they are accountable.
- **Psychology:** Contemplate and discuss the most effective ways to hold people accountable without negative consequences (i.e., don’t use punishment). Discuss psychological concepts related to accountability, including social loafing, and intrinsic and extrinsic motivation.
support them in achieving their goal in a supportive way.

- Everyone’s voice should be in the discussion, including how individual contributions will be noted/recognized in the assignment (e.g., will people put their names next to their contributions; consider if a contribution sheet will be part of the assignment that gets turned in).
- As the group is beginning to form, to avoid disagreements, discuss the available time that group members have. Get the group to agree on a certain time commitment of work per week.
- Be clear about what the goal is. It can be frustrating if the goal changes, especially if the goal continues to get larger as time goes on and people can’t meet the goal.
- If change is needed to a goal, be clear on providing group opportunity to understand factors underlying need, and direction of change to meet revised goals.

**Guiding Questions for developing assignments focused on “Accountability”**

- How can we as professors help alleviate or lessen anxiety related to accountability and help our students succeed?
- What are each student’s duties and the agreed upon timeline for completing said duties?
- How will teammates provide their work to each other?
- How did the student take ownership of getting the information about what is expected of them?
- What is each student’s active role?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Considerations for developing assignments focused on “Collaborative Team Process”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Uses collective processes and strategies to move toward team goals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Be clear about what you want the students to learn about the group process itself (if relevant).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- If a group presentation is part of the class, students could share grading</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example assignment instructions/prompts for “Collaborative Team Process”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General Examples for assignment instructions for “Collaborative Team Process”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- If the class involves talking about the theory of groups (like the stages forming, norming, etc.--), have students get into groups and work on a project, then at the end, in a reflection paper, discuss how their group dynamics “fit” with the theory.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
with the instructor using a rubric provided by the instructor.
• Consider that the logistics involved in creating, observing, and checking-in with groups will differ somewhat with in-person and online environments.
• For longer-term collaborative work, incorporate team development theories (i.e. Tuckman model).

**Tips for “Collaborative Team Process”**
• Encourage students to share how they want to be supported in a group.
• Allow students to self-assign their roles based on their strengths and interests in contributing to the assignment.
• Conduct team building activities to help students build community (e.g. carpet squares; ropes courses).
• Allow students to co-create mutual understanding and have discussion of what they see and want and can contribute from a collaborative approach.
• Be explicit about what type(s) of collaborations may be well-suited to the assignment such as integrating individual contributions or all working on the same item together at the same time.
• Model providing respectful and constructive feedback. Ask students to be respectful and constructive in their feedback, either in their own way or in the way they learned from observing you.
• Provide the space for students to authentically react to the feedback they

• At the end of the class, have students who have been in groups reflect on their experience in the group including their own challenges and growth.
• Have students get into groups and the end product is a both a group presentation on a topic and a paper. For example, in a class on group dynamics, different groups could present to the class on different types of groups (e.g., cults, rock bands, juries, etc.)---and how group dynamics tend to work in that particular group. The final product could then be a paper.
• Assign each student in the group a different role when discussing a reading: 1) Summarizer, 2) Relater, 3) Critic, 4) Defender, 5) Proposer of an Alternative.
• On a topic, have different group members specialize on different aspects, come together and discuss, brainstorm about what to keep, what’s missing, what to delete. Then, as a group present the topic cohesively to the class with the instructor filling in the gaps on the topic.
• Have students provide constructive feedback to one another’s contributions to improve for upcoming assignments. (ex. giving impromptu speeches to their group, and the group provides feedback)
• *Jigsaw classroom:* On a topic, different group members focus on different aspects, and come together and teach each other. The goal is that each individual learns the topic, with part of the learning coming from their own research, and the other part coming from learning from their group members.
• *Presentations:* Develop a plan together using a topic that is going to be presented, identify research or other work that needs to go into it and who will present which pieces of information, and then practice the presentation together (transitioning from one person to the next, etc.).
• *Role playing:* Have members of the group self-assign to a role that they must act out, to show their problem solving and collaborative learning skills.
receive so that quality of feedback and work gradually improve.

- Incorporate strategies/best practices for co-creating (e.g., setting expectations, creating a timeline together, building community, agreeing on how to communicate and give feedback.
- Have students complete a self-assessment to determine their own strength/style regarding how they might interact with each other (True Colors, etc.).
- Support identifying strengths and areas of growth for individual team members and the collective team.

Guiding Questions for developing assignments focused on “Collaborative Team Process”

- Can you measure what you’re telling the students to do (think about the grading in advance)?
- Are all students’ contributions essential to the outcome of the assignment?
- How does collaborating affect the outcome of the assignment?
- Have you given students prompts that will help them consider how to work with one another?
- What are tangible outcomes that students must create together to set-up for collaborative space before beginning an assignment or project (timeline, expectation, etc)?
- Have you provided students with information about the importance of discussing schedules and how they will

Discipline Specific Examples for “Collaborative Team Process”

- **Communications:** Allow students to engage in discourse to reach a collective outcome (e.g., debating differing topics, practicing theory in action).
- **English:** Print out a poem in large text. Cut the text up into several different stanzas. Place them out of order on a table in the class. Ask students to work together to determine the original sequence of the stanzas. Compare the original with their sequence. Ask them what rules they used to try to determine how the stanzas should be placed.
- **Economics:** Jointly create a dataset by blending group work (e.g. discussing appropriate sources and potential problems) with individual work (gathering specific data).
- **Psychology:** present students with a few prompts about concepts that need to be researched further in the field of psychology. Ask students to work together to identify an independent variable (IV; and how to manipulate it), dependent variable (DV; and how to measure it), as well as who are their participants and how to sample them. Have them discuss what it would be like to be the experimenter versus the participant in the study.
work together (e.g., phone calls, Zoom, in-person meetings)?
- Do students have an opportunity to reflect on their collaboration process and how to improve it in the future? As part of this, do they also have built-in group time and sharing time?
- How does the assignment allow for the students to grow/challenge their collaborative learning skills?
- Are there reflection prompts mid-way, and resources to provide opportunity for them to learn and adapt to new strategies?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Considerations for developing assignments focused on “Leadership”</th>
<th>Example assignment instructions/prompts for “Leadership”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Facilitates the work and advancement of the team through the use of leadership strategies and principles.</td>
<td>General Examples for assignment instructions for “Leadership”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Leadership is based on values. As these values are personal, expect different insights from different students.</td>
<td>• Provide students with cards with different leadership styles (democratic, autocratic, micro-manager, etc) and have them practice leading something in that style. Emphasize there are different leadership styles with different strengths/weaknesses for each style and that there is no one-correct leadership style. Ask for feedback from the leader about what it is like to lead in that way and ask the other students what it is like to be led in that way.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Recognize that leadership isn’t something that can be fulfilled completely. It is a continuous journey where as the end goal is being reached, one is also gathering insight on themselves, troubleshooting pathways and alternatives, as well as recognizing that value embodies growth.</td>
<td>• Create systems for team support and learning (i.e. 1:1s check-in system, evaluation).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Leadership should reflect diverse input. It is valuable to combine different ideas into a shared view.</td>
<td>• Discuss what you believe leadership is including different styles of leadership you have observed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Consider relevant leadership skills such as, transparency/authenticity; ethicality; trustworthiness; empathy; communication; active listening.</td>
<td>• Acting out scenarios: in a given scenario that involves a crisis, provide index cards with instructions on how to lead (e.g. by appealing to shared goals, or by praising small improvements, etc.) to each group member, and</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- Provide a safe, supportive environment that fosters collaboration, teamwork, conversation
- Guide team/individuals via a variety of strategies and resources.
- Lead in a way that invites the leadership of others.

**Tips for “Leadership”**
- Differentiate being an authoritarian leader vs. being an ethical leader.
- Keep focus on the end-goal.
- Challenge students to try out different styles of leadership.
- Discuss examples of both effective and ineffective leadership.
- Be a role model for the leadership skills you are encouraging students to build.
- Have students take ownership of how leadership is assessed in the class.
- Identify how leadership may vary as a result of different cultures and/or experiences.
- Provide examples/guidance on how/when to delegate and give ownership/responsibility to others.
- Allow for students who are not normally in leadership positions to practice leadership; allow/encourage diverse approaches when practicing.

- Have them intervene in the situation according to these prompts.
- Have students take personality tests to identify people’s strengths/preferences. This information can be used to create groups.

**Discipline Specific Examples for “Leadership”**
- **Psychology:** Are particular personality traits associated with desire to become a leader? Are any of these traits associated with dangerous (i.e., authoritarian) leadership styles? Are there other individual difference characteristics that tend to be associated with different leadership styles?
- **Psychology (I/O):** First, students read about Theory X, Theory Y, and Transformational Leadership styles. In small groups, discuss pros and cons of each style. Which style would they prefer to use as a leader? Why? Is that the same style they would prefer in a leader leading them?
- **Communication:** Have students practice leadership by displaying their communication skills in a group setting.

**Guiding Questions for developing assignments focused on “Leadership”**
- How does leadership look in action?
- Who are leaders you have observed?
- How can leadership enable collaboration rather than interfere with it?
- Does the way you have organized your class allow for all students to step into the role of leadership?
- What are steps students can take to become effective leaders?
- How do you measure leadership? When? Start or end of course or both?
- Will you be assessing development of the skills/improvement or some set standard of leadership?
### ILO Collaboration, Teamwork, and Leadership (CTL) Rubric
Approved by Academic Senate, April 13, 2021

Description: Essential to our university experience, leadership and collaboration skills are vital for student’s engagement in diverse workspaces and communities. Students work in teams on classroom assignments, service-learning projects, student organizations, and with co-curricular activities to build collaboration, teamwork, and leadership skills.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social skills</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Skills used to communicate and interact with others.</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Examples: Responsive; supportive; adaptable; open to diverse perspectives; self-aware; actively listens, clearly communicates ideas (verbally and non-verbally); manages tension within the team; demonstrates cultural/gender/identity competence (avoids micro-aggressions, uses bias-free, anti-racist language).</td>
<td>Consistent application of appropriate social skills.</td>
<td>Adequate application of appropriate social skills.</td>
<td>Some application of appropriate social skills.</td>
<td>Little to no application of appropriate social skills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Accountability</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Accepts responsibility and contributes to the team goals.</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Collaborative Team Process</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Uses collective processes and strategies to move toward team goals.</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Examples: Identifies team roles and tasks in an ethical, equitable and responsible manner; brainstorms, uses participatory decision making, motivates; reflects on process and improves as needed.</td>
<td>Strong evidence of collaborative processes.</td>
<td>Adequate evidence of collaborative processes.</td>
<td>Some evidence of collaborative processes.</td>
<td>Little to no evidence of collaborative processes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Leadership</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Facilitates the work and advancement of the team through the use of leadership strategies and principles.</em></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Examples: Takes and delegates responsibility; demonstrates situational awareness; provides direction and support as needed; fosters inclusivity; recognizes others’ achievements and growth.</td>
<td>Effective use of leadership strategies.</td>
<td>Adequate use of leadership strategies.</td>
<td>Some use leadership strategies.</td>
<td>Little to no use of leadership strategies.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Assignment Essentials Relevant to All Assignments

Students complete assignments to:
- practice applying skills, content, and concepts learned, demonstrate their achievement, and
- to be assessed and receive feedback on the achievement of assignment, course, and program learning outcomes.

- How will my assignment prompt students to show what content they have learned and/or demonstrate their skills?
- Does the array of assignments in this class address students with varied learning preferences multiple means of demonstrating knowledge and skill acquisition?

Students need clear and transparent expectations and instructions documented in writing:
- Assignment instructions should clearly identify tasks, provide the required format elements, and describe the final product.
- Assignment descriptions should help students clearly understand the main purpose.
- Assignment descriptions should also demonstrate the connections to how their work meets learning outcomes, builds on their knowledge and skills for future assignments, relates to graduation, and has professional relevance.
- A grading rubric that expresses expectations and aligns with the outcomes will assist students as they complete the assignment.

- How will assignment instructions clarify what tasks to do, how they are connected, how to get started, and how to complete the tasks?
- How will you know if students met the assignment expectations; how will students be assessed?

Chunk and scaffold assignments: Students perform better on assignments when instructors break them into manageable chunks. Presenting students with smaller assignments that build into a larger one creates the opportunity for early feedback and improvement.

Example of smaller assignments that build toward a research essay that meets expectations:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course timing</th>
<th>Week 6</th>
<th>Week 8</th>
<th>Week 10</th>
<th>Week 12</th>
<th>Week 14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Developmental Assignment Due</td>
<td>Thesis statement</td>
<td>Annotated Bibliography</td>
<td>Outline</td>
<td>Essay Draft</td>
<td>Final essay</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reflection Aids Retention: Students’ learning improves and sticks when they reflect on their process and their completed assignment:
- Ask students to report what they learned from the assignment or what they would do differently in a future assignment.
- Student reflection on assignment process and performance may also help you shape the next version of the assignment.