



University Summary Report
Assessment of ILO Collaboration, Teamwork, & Leadership Student Learning
September 2023, v2

INTRODUCTION

Purpose of ILOs

[Institutional Learning Outcomes \(ILOs\)](#) are those learning outcomes that are expected of every graduate of the institution, both undergraduate and graduate. ILOs are closely aligned with [General Education](#) requirements and mapped to Program Learning Outcomes. ILO Assessment follows the [ILO Long Term Assessment Plan](#) which aligns the assessment schedule for undergraduate, graduate, and general education assessment.

Evidence of Collaboration, Teamwork and Leadership Throughout Curricular and Co-Curricular at CSUEB

At Cal State East Bay, students engage with the Institutional Learning Outcomes (ILOs) of Collaboration, Teamwork, and Leadership (CTL) through curricular and co-curricular experiences. These outcomes are found in ILO, program, and course descriptions, program and course learning outcomes, and Student Life and Leadership program descriptions. In particular, collaboration learning outcomes can be found in our lower division A1 (Oral Communication) and A3 (Critical Thinking) General Education courses, as well as each of the upper division GE areas (Science Inquiry and Quantitative Reasoning, Arts/Humanities, and Social Sciences). CTL program outcomes are directly assessed by faculty college committees and reviewed through the Committee [on Academic Planning and Review \(CAPR\)](#).

Assessment of Institutional Learning Outcome of Collaboration, Teamwork, and Leadership (CTL)

Following the ILO Long Term Assessment Schedule, Cal State East Bay gathered recent student learning data in support of the assessment of the University's Collaboration, Teamwork and Leadership (CTL) ILO. These data are intended to provide additional context for existing "Closing the Loop" academic and co-academic review discussions, analysis, and decision making to improve student learning in and out of the classroom.

Secondary Assessment: Student Survey Most Authentic Way to Assess CTL ILO

Due to the challenges of assessing collaboration, teamwork, and leadership competencies in student work samples at the institutional level without requiring a common "signature assignment," secondary assessment through a student survey was identified as the most authentic approach for assessing learning experiences during students' time at Cal State East Bay.

While the ILO is Collaboration, Teamwork, and Leadership, secondary assessment of student learning in Fall 2022 was for teamwork and leadership. To design a survey that would be clear to students with results of value for university-wide continuous improvement discussions, two of the four [ILO CTL rubric criteria](#) were

selected, *teamwork* (from collaborative team process) and *leadership* - using definitions from the rubric to describe the meaning for students.

METHODS

Relevant data and university sources for Collaboration, Teamwork, and Leadership were gathered from CSUEB and external sources (Table 1 and Table 2). Additionally, colleges will integrate relevant program review and other data into “Closing the Loop” continuous improvement college discussions as appropriate.

Table 1. Sources of key data, for ILO Collaboration, Teamwork, and Leadership

Relevant Sources: CSUEB	Date
CSUEB: Teamwork and Leadership student survey questions <i>Survey questions asked of CSUEB undergraduate and graduate students including where skills were learned and how they were applied. Qualitative responses were grouped into topic areas and coded by ILO Subcommittee members.</i>	Fall, 2022
CSUEB: Teamwork and Leadership student survey results <i>Survey response dashboard from 1,390 CSUEB undergraduate and graduate student responses.</i>	Fall, 2022
CSUEB: Programs <i>Undergraduate and Graduate Programs aligned to a Collaboration, Teamwork, and/or Leadership outcome as shown in curriculum maps on college assessment sites.</i>	Summer, 2023
CSUEB: Catalog <i>Program descriptions that contain the word “leadership” or “teamwork”</i>	2023-2024
CSUEB: ILO Collaboration, Teamwork, Leadership Rubric & Assignment Guide <i>Developed by and for faculty to support crafting assignments that help students demonstrate their achievement of the Institutional Learning Outcomes as they apply to disciplines and programs.</i>	2021
CSUEB: ILO Co-curricular Collaboration, Teamwork, and Leadership (CTL) student survey results <i>A survey aligned to the CTL ILO of student experiences with CTL related co-curricular experiences at Cal State East Bay.</i>	February, 2020
CSUEB: Identifying Collaboration, Teamwork, and Leadership Practices on Campus <i>Article summarizing CSUEB survey results from students, local employers, and catalog.</i>	Fall, 2013

Table 2. Relevant sources of key data for ILO Teamwork and Leadership secondary assessment external to CSUEB.

Relevant Sources: External to CSUEB	Date
How College Contributes to Workforce Success: Employers Views on What Matters Most Employer survey for AAC&U by Hanover Research.	2021
Job Outlook 2023 National Association of Colleges and Employers (NACE) Survey on employer hiring intentions for graduating class. This source was identified as having high relevance by CSUEB Academic Advising and Career Education leadership.	2023
High Impact Practices American Association of Colleges and Universities (AAC&U) teaching and learning practices that demonstrate evidence of significant educational benefits for students - especially those historically underserved.	2008

RESULTS

CSUEB Teamwork and Leadership Student Survey Questions

In the Fall of 2023, all CSUEB undergraduate sophomore, junior, and senior students along with all graduate students were sent [this survey](#). 1,390 students responded (11%).

CSUEB Teamwork and Leadership Student Survey Results

View the 2022-2023 Cal State East Bay ILO Teamwork and Leadership Survey Results interactive Dashboard [here](#).

<https://analytics.csueastbay.edu/t/Public/views/ILOTeamworkandLeadership/TeamworkWhereLearned?%3Aembed=y&%3Aiid=3&%3AisGuestRedirectFromVizportal=y>

Undergraduate and Graduate Programs with a Collaboration, Teamwork and/or Leadership Outcome

College of Business and Economics Curriculum Maps	B.S., BA, Undergraduate M.B.A., Graduate
College of Letters, Arts, and Social Science Curriculum Maps	B.A. Environmental Studies B.S. Geography B.A. Global Studies B.S. Criminal Justice B.A. Philosophy

	M.A. Music B.A. Political Science B.S. Speech Pathology and Audiology B.A. Sociology M.S.W. Social Work B.A. Theatre Arts
College of Science Curriculum Maps	B.S. Computer Science M.S. Computer Science B.S. Geology B.A. Geology B.S. Environmental Sciences M.S. Environmental Geosciences B.S. Computer Engineering B.S. Industrial Engineering B.S. Nursing M.S. Nursing B.S. Physics B.A. Physics B.S. Public Health M.S. Statistics M.S. Biostatistics
College of Education & Allied Studies Curriculum Maps	M.S. Educational Leadership Ed.D. Educational Leadership M.S. Counseling M.S. Special Education (all concentrations) B.S. Kinesiology M.S. Kinesiology B.S. Recreation B.S. Hospitality & Tourism M.S. Hospitality, Recreation & Tourism M.S. Early Childhood Education M.S. Educational Technology

CSUEB 2023-2024 [Catalog](#) Search of Collaboration, Teamwork, and Leadership

In a search of the 2023-2024 CSUEB Catalog, 65 program descriptions (including concentrations) contained the term *collaborative* (0 contained the term *collaboration*), 35 program descriptions (including concentrations) contained the term *teamwork*, and 35 program descriptions (including concentrations) contained the term *leadership*.

[CSUEB: Identifying Collaboration, Teamwork, and Leadership Practices on Campus, 2013](#)

This article written by CSUEB instructors summarized survey results from 877 CSUEB students at all class levels, survey results from 27 local employers who hired CSUEB students, a scan of the CSUEB course catalog, and external research. The themes from this work included:

- CSUEB employers highly valued CTL competencies.
- CSUEB students reported exposure to CTL experiences in about 50% of courses and/or group activities, and they believed they benefited from these experiences.
- Students reported that coursework contributed more to team member and leader effectiveness than did co-curricular activities.
- Participation in co-curricular activities was generally low.
- Educators, students, and employers agreed that learning CTL competencies was a fundamental part of a college education.

[CSUEB: ILO Co-curricular Collaboration, Teamwork, and Leadership student survey results of seniors](#)

In conjunction with a faculty pilot of the ILO CTL rubric in course assignments, 20% of seniors (1079) were randomly selected as prospective survey participants in the fall of 2019. The total sample size was 158; the response rate was 14.6%. Forty-three percent of respondents (68/158) reported engagement in some co-curricular, approximately 75% of whom reported an improvement in teamwork and leadership skills.

[How College Contributes to Workforce Success: Employers' Views on What Matters Most, 2021](#)

Employer survey for AAC&U by Hanover Research.

Out of 15 skills, employers ranked the ability to work effectively in teams as #1 for college graduates.

[Job Outlook 2023](#)

National Association of Colleges and Employers (NACE)

Of the career competencies employers rated for importance, teamwork was #3 and leadership was #8 (p. 27).

[High-Impact Educational Practices AAC&U](#)

High-Impact Educational Practices (HIPs) outlines a set of teaching and learning practices with positive impact on all students, especially underserved. Among them are collaborative assignments and projects as well as service learning, both of which can help students build teamwork and leadership skills.

Results Trends for Discussion

Student Survey Results for Teamwork and Leadership

- CSUEB students report teamwork and leadership to be a significant part of their curricular experiences at CSUEB, both in their course instruction and group work.
- In the student survey results for both teamwork and leadership, the top skill learned was communication. For teamwork, the second top skill learned was collaboration/relationship building. For leadership, the second top skill learned was listening to others.
- For teamwork, students made explicit connections to diversity, equity, and inclusion through learning about openness to different ideas and people.
- Students' survey responses are consistent with the dimensions identified in the [ILO Collaboration, Teamwork, and Leadership rubric](#).

Additional CSUEB and Employer Trends

- Teamwork and leadership competencies are ILOs, are identified in a number of CSUEB curricular and co-curricular program outcomes, and are highly valued by employers.

Possible Discussion Questions

- Are students applying teamwork and leadership skills in ways faculty expect?
- How do we intentionally identify the strategies we are using in our curriculum to build students' skills in collaboration, teamwork and leadership in courses (e.g. group work, assignments)?
- How do we build collaboration, teamwork, and leadership skills in a virtual environment?

COLLEGE DISCUSSIONS

College/Unit Discussions

Led by associate deans, each college/unit will decide their own approach to reviewing meaningful results and having productive closing the loop discussions:

Possible Meeting Format

- Brief overview and purpose of large-scale assessment
- Presentation of key Teamwork & Leadership survey results for the college/unit
- Discussion in large or smaller groups: consider questions that fit your college/unit and record discussion results:
 - *First discuss results:*
 - How does this information fit with our experience of students' development of skills at Cal State East Bay when taking a course?
 - What are our students' strengths?
 - What are the most noticeable gaps?
 - *Next, discuss possible/tentative course of action*
 - What seems to be working well that we can further support for building student competency for CTL?
 - What can we do to improve?
 - How can we better meet students' needs for building CTL competencies at critical junctures for their learning?
- Summarize key topics and possible action steps and review next steps.

Special acknowledgement goes to Gretchen Reevy in Psychology and Chris Chamberlain in Hospitality, Recreation, and Tourism for their numerous contributions since 2012 furthering the assessment of the Collaboration, Leadership, and Teamwork Institutional Learning Outcome. Since 2012, Gretchen and Chris conducted student and employer surveys, and researched, published, and disseminated information to faculty and co-curricular groups. Gretchen and Chris's contributions also included co-leading faculty groups developing, piloting, and implementing the Collaboration, Teamwork, and Leadership assessment rubric as well as developing an assignment guide for faculty.

