

Personnel Committee Meeting Minutes of February 2, 2022

- I. CALL TO ORDER at **1:00 PM**
- II. [ROLL CALL](#)
Present: Kabir Dhillon, Angelica de Leon, Mirna Maamou, Zaira Perez, Martin Castillo, Kristtina Caro

Late: Erik Pinlac, Michael Cesena
- III. ACTION ITEM - **Approval of the Agenda**
Motion to approve the agenda of February 2, 2022, by **M. Maamou**, second by **Z. Perez**, motion **CARRIED**.
- IV. ACTION ITEM - **Approval of the January 19, 2022**
Motion to postpone the approval of January 19, 2022 to next Personnel Committee meeting, by **K. Dhillon**, second by **M. Maamou**, motion **CARRIED**.
- V. PUBLIC COMMENT – **Public Comment is intended as a time for any member of the public to address the committee on any issues affecting ASI and/or the California State University, East Bay.**
No public comment.
1:46
- VI. UNFINISHED ITEMS:
No unfinished items.
1:52
- VII. NEW BUSINESS ITEMS:

A. DISCUSSION ITEM: [ASI Committee Appointments](#)



The Personnel Committee will discuss interviewed applicants for ASI Committees. **K. Dhillon** says there are 3 applications to be discussed. The first applicant is for the Programming Committee which is Sasidhar Mettimi. The document submitted by both Ashmita and Tyler is for the Programming Council applicant. Their past and current experiences in organizing events, and his passion for ensuring that all students on campus have equal access to resources, transportation, and more. He is the President of the International Student Association at CSU East Bay and has experience delegating work to others. Also, he has worked with people in a collaborative setting which is great because of the work style occurs between Director of Wellness and Director of Programming. He has critical thinking skills such as being able to analyze situations then takes into consideration all the pros and cons of the decision-making process. The goals that would make the committee successful is having the passion for helping all students on campus, confidence of contributing ideas that will make a tighter bond within the Programming Committee and striking new event ideas to ensure student success on campus. The next applicants are Cesar Hidalgo and Malayika Zaffar for the Legislative Affairs Committee.

J. Domino has had class with these candidates previously and they are passionate in doing the research for Legislative Affairs about bills and things that pertain to the committee. Cesar is a great candidate because he had done research about some of the CSSA bills and kept himself updated about the process of the bills. He knows what to say, when to say, and knows the process of the work. He would be a great member to work, has great potential, cares about the students and unifying voices that are not heard. To hear him say that he cares about unifying voices for communities that are not heard and that is the energetic spirit that goes with Legislative Affairs Committee. Malayika knows how to do research, look up bills, differentiate how bills are for going to be for students, and whether or not the bills are in the best interest of students. This played a huge role in my decision of wanting her to be appointed. She has the experience and what we are looking for when we do have events and activities. These two individuals are great candidates for the



committees and if everything goes well then, I would love to have them on my committee.

K. Dhillon says the applicants will be appointed at the next Board of Directors meeting on Wednesday. Are there any other committee applications or recommendations at this point?

M. Maamou does not have a recommendation yet, but I have a new inquiry. There is a finance student named Haris who will be submitting the application today. When I find out that he is eligible then we will do a phone to be able to appoint him immediately.

K. Dhillon states that during the Personnel Committee Meeting next week on Wednesday, have your applicant so we can discuss and assuming they are eligible, we can move forward to appoint them.

J. Domino has 2 more applicants. One of them is Malia Heeren who I want to appoint if she is still eligible. Her name is not on the list, but she is a part of another committee. I assume she is eligible but will check on her eligibility for this semester. The other applicant is Cody, but he was not able to make it to the interview because of an emergency. He did reschedule to do interview tomorrow so I will send their applications and results by tomorrow.

K. Dhillon will be going ahead with Malayika and Cesar. When the interview with Cody is done, send the documents to me and we can discuss his recommendation on Wednesday. As for Malia, we have to double check if she is eligible, but we will connect offline about that. If you want to appoint her to your committee, we can do that and discuss it next Wednesday. Any other discussion or questions?

7:45

B. DISCUSSION ITEM: Board Member Concerns

The Personnel Committee will discuss concerns regarding Director of Legislative Affairs Jasmine Domino.

K. Dhillon says the concerns are on 3 pieces which are communication, incomplete tasks, and performance, failing to appoint at least 1 committee member by the end of Fall Semester, and the interpersonal working relations with other officers. As for communication, there has been concerns that Jasmine does not communicate in



general. As mentioned at the Board Meeting, she does not submit her tasks as frequently as she should and overall providing updates with the incomplete tasks. There was a task delegated to Jasmine starting in July which was to choose a piece of legislation and draft a resolution in support of that bill. The task has been on since July and has not been completed. I checked the resolution document and there has not been any edits since August. We talked about the resolution writing during the retreat back in July. I believe, we did meet with Jasmine for one on one to talk about resolution writing with Martin on the document. The goal for committee members last semester was to appoint at least one member and they were not expected to have quorum but at least have one member. However, Jasmine did not meet that deadline. Overall, a lack of updates on legislation policies, resolutions, and enforcements of resolutions. With functionality to Board meetings, out of the 11 meetings, Jasmine was late to at least 9 of those meetings which I can provide the specific meetings that she had been late to. With working on relations with other Board members, this feedback came from the committee report. I am working on the reports and then send them out individually. The concerns that came up was communication, working well with other members, being professional, and working in a group setting. I will let Jasmine speak on her part and then it is open for discussion.

J. Domino did not mention to everyone in this meeting and at the Board meeting that I do not send weekly updates. I did send an email to Kabir and AJ stating what I have done from August to October. When you requested an email from me, regarding drafting a resolution, I created my own document to not feel pressured. I have my own document which I can send out, but the resolution did not get passed. I listened to Erik's feedback and go into the CSSA website. The resolution that I want to do is the current reform and CSSA sent a message about trying to get it back out there and back open which is a surprise challenge. The bill that I wanted to do is about what affects students such as Cal Grant and paying for college. I agree that for the resolution, I do not have it together. For appointing at least one member, I did have Malia Heeren. I did not appoint her because I wanted to have the whole team seated before I appointed students. I will start to appoint students



as they apply which was a miscommunication on my end. For working in group settings and the communication aspect from the mid-year reports, even when I am late to some of the meetings, I am present at the Board meetings. I did not come to the recent retreat because my grandmother passed away, and everyone knew about that. I do not understand about working in group settings because I do know how to work in a group if we were to have that ability. We are working collectively as a team, but everybody has their own separate tasks which that portion is final. I have been good with sending the email and I did not send one for January because I was sent to Personnel. I thought we would talk about it in the meeting, but I could have sent an email.

K. Dhillon asks Erik could you clarify on the resolution Jasmine is referring to? Jasmine mentioned that your feedback was to not move forward with the resolution.

J. Domino says Erik told me to use the CSSA bills which I tried to do. On their website, you see that the bill did not pass, which are the bills that I want to do. Also, Ashmita is working on them.

E. Pinlac says the feedback given her was to look at what CSSA had and could base it off there to start with.

K. Dhillon thanks Erik for clarifying. I am curious, why there has not been a resolution in regard to any CSSA sponsored bills and how come there has not been a resolution that is in support of any of the bills.

J. Domino states for the bills that are passing, Ashmita is writing a resolution on them which deal with mental health. The bills that are not passing have my interest because they deal with financial aspects which students deal along with mental health. I can attest to that but there are financial aspects of school that are not passing so I can give you a resolution but if the bill does not pass then there is no meaning. I can write a resolution but if it did not get passed and I know it is not going to pass, how can I work towards that in the next term. How can the next Director of Legislative Affairs try to work on that resolution?

A. De Leon asks what do we do a resolution or a bill that we would want to support does not pass? Are we able to look for another one that might potentially be in the process of passing or has passed and we want to support it, have we thought about



that? For example, the one bill did not pass, and we wanted to move on from it, have we thought about looking for another one?

J. Domino answers yes, I did think about looking for another one.

M. Castillo says from a broad perspective, Jasmine addressing this and having been at several conversations similar to this throughout the years on Personnel Committee, it is not personal but more about making sure that people are being held accountable. Some of the things that you have shared, which I understand that time is rough right now, but the idea that Ashmita took the lead on those two resolutions would have been perfect to partner with Ashmita as she is working on it since she is the Director of Wellness. The idea of working together was brought up because it is not about a character assassination but about guiding you to use what is remaining in your current term. You are going to produce things what you want to produce, and you are going leave ASI in a better place than it was before we got here. I assume you are graduating and if you come back, that is even better which is where the conversation heading.

K. Dhillon says Martin perfectly stated everything because it is the basis of this conversation.

M. Maamou adds that the communication aspect of it, I understand there are not many group projects but if Ashmita started a resolution then that is a great chance to collaborate, but it seems that it was not considered at all. When it comes to groupwork, it is not about doing projects together but how we communicate with each other. This is not personal attack and that is not my intention. If you have been here and see that I brought myself to Personnel Committee being summoned here, we are a team holding each other accountable. We all have high standards for each other and know we are a great team, so we expect great things from each other.

K. Dhillon says Jasmine your role is important because it deals with all the legislation whether that is lobbying, working on legislative bills within the city of Hayward, and work on legislation. This conversation has come up as there are not many updates about legislation whether or not ASI at Cal State East Bay should be supporting this feature piece of legislation, should be doing lobby visits for this initiative or legislation or should do phone banking. In the past, we have done



postcards, and these are examples of things that are related to Legislative Affairs. We have not heard any updates regarding that, and which is why the conversation is coming about how is it going and to Martin's point about collaboration. You can collaborate and partner with someone which there was an opportunity to partner. It is understandable if the bill or resolution did not pass or go the way we wanted it to go. However, there are other pieces of legislation that you could advocate for that includes that language or includes the things that you want it to say. In order to do that you could schedule visits with assembly members and representatives that advocate for that change in that legislation. For the part to being late to meetings, it is not acceptable and there is no other way especially when it is 9 out of 11 meetings. We emphasize professionalism and these are skills that are staying with you while you are at East Bay and when moving into the workforce, your career path, or what you want to do after you graduate. To come to the meetings late is not acceptable especially since it has not been approved by the Personnel Committee and I do not believe it is for class. It was not communicated to me or AJ.

A. De Leon echoes to what everyone said as I would emphasize that this conversation is the Personnel Committee is reframing that we are here to work together as a team. We are all students and working together. Jasmine, I want to say for the rest of the committee, it is not to say that you have not been doing anything because you and I both go to CSSA. You are actively participating in CSSA and seeing your texts about a great piece, or I enjoyed what this campus had to say, you reach out to me about it and so I appreciate it. I believe the overall theme is bringing that piece to the larger group so that everyone knows what is happening. I will admit that I could do a better job at bringing what we talk about CSSA to the Board or Senate, which is something that Jasmine and I work on. We do not want discredit the things you have done. It is about what we want to know so that everyone in the circle can help you feel recognized for the things that you have done. We all have done great things this year and so we want to make sure that you are being recognized for the work. After hearing everything, I wanted to know what the biggest obstacle for you in terms of ASI has been and how can we as a team support you and help you improve with that. At the end of the day, we are ending



our terms and so I would want to hear how we could support you so that looks different for everyone. I can clarify the question if necessary.

J. Domino states by holding me accountable.

K. Dhillon says we will follow up with Jasmine. We will be deciding whether there would be a sanction or not, and that would be in the following meeting. As for accountability, that is the point of this conversation on why we have weekly email updates so we can see what everyone is working on. If we are asked what we are working on, then we are able to clarify. I want to emphasize that it is a learning opportunity on how you can take this feedback and improve with this for the rest of your term and into next endeavor.

J. Domino asks are my emails not being communicated effectively? I am transparent in my emails.

K. Dhillon clarifies that it is that the frequency of the. You provide updates from everything before August, but I would have you go back to see if there was anything between August and December. I believe, everyone can agree that we would prefer over communication to the point where it is too much which we would tell you to slow down. Communicating every week by starting with what you are working on, what is the process of it, what is the plan to complete it, and clarifying what is not getting completed and why. It is not about it being transparent enough but about the frequency. Any other discussion or questions?

27:15

C. DISCUSSION ITEM: **Board Member Accountability**

The Personnel Committee will discuss accountability for Vice President of Finance/CFO Mirna Maamou.

M. Maamou believes in holding myself to the same standards as any other Board member, especially in a VP position. I wish to communicate with everyone, be transparent and take responsibility. I have had lost track of emails previously and was behind on club funding, but I was able to make it to all the meetings. There was also lack of communication. I want to acknowledge that and let everyone know what is happening. I have discussed this with Erik, Sneh and Doris whom I mainly work with them. I did get caught up with my work and set up a plan which is



checking emails every day and continue to keep up with them. Then, having consistent one on one meetings with Sneh which I believe are helpful for both of us of us and we are able to stay updated since know she needs my signatures so the work can be processed, and I am not behind on them. I will also be having one on one meetings with Erik. I wanted to mention this and be transparent with everyone. **E. Pinlac** says we are transparent about the communication you have with us. During last semester, when Mirna was not answering emails or could not get contacted virtually which cause minor delays on some work. In the role of VP of Finance Committee, if documents do not get signed immediately or in a certain time, it delays things for all departments because any purchasing has to get through her. We did work through some solutions during our last one to one meeting. There will be a one on one meeting with her and Sneh every other week. I will be meeting with every other week to name what is most important. I have talked to the staff, and they have been reaching out via cell phone and when they get to that point it means you are not looking at your emails or communicating effectively. Mirna have agreed to check emails on a frequent basis. Check your emails and respond to them. **M. Castillo** thanks Mirna for bringing this up. We have talked about this, and it was earlier this year with Neilah. I am not used to students holding themselves accountable or taking accountability. You recognized that there were things that fell through, and I appreciate that you brought it to our attention. Since the matter was not brought up by someone else, it makes me think that it was not a big problem as much as you thought it was, but you communicated with Erik and held yourself accountable.

K. Dhillon agrees with everything Martin has said as this is the first time when someone sent them self in, and it takes self-awareness to do that. Is there any support you need from us or want us to hold you accountable?

M. Maamou admits it is a flaw that I have that I have struggled with which is when I start to feel that I am losing control. With my boundaries, I let it affect what is expected of me work-wise which makes it seem that I do not have strong work. The thought of losing control of my boundaries leads me to almost stop doing my work which was when I started to fall behind, and felt overwhelmed of not knowing how



to catch up. When I started having one on one meeting with Sneh, it was helpful, effective and a better communication. When we have the meeting, we go over all necessary documents and work processes which is effective. If I fail to respond to an email, let me know and I will get back to you. Erik has told me to check an email and respond to it which is fine because he is doing this to help and support me rather than an attack. I am all better now. I have cleaned my inbox and it will be kept that way. Having the one on one meeting have been helpful for me.

A. De Leon says as student leaders, we have high executive functioning skills and one of them is metacognition. Martin mentioned self-awareness and your ability to imagine the big picture about what is happening and how to fix it. That is a skill we have to learn and figure out. For example, this is not working for me so let's try and find something else which speaks to you. I wanted to ask since someone who has high metacognition cannot set boundaries, and Mirna talked about it. What are your boundaries? Is there a certain time when you do not want us to contact you, so you are not being overwhelmed? How can we support you? Can you specify any boundaries?

M. Maamou says during my class time since I have in-person classes and labs which is a non-negotiable time. I understand that I cannot look at my phone or answer phone call but if someone is calling me, I have to take the call. I cannot ignore phone calls so instead of saying, I am in class it would better not getting a call. I have updated my calendar and it shows my class schedule. During midterms, if I sense that I need space and would not be able to get the work done, I will prioritize the midterm and send out the emails. I will communicate about this throughout this semester but my class time is important.

K. Dhillon asks any discussion or question?

38:09

D. DISCUSSION ITEM: Search Firm for Executive Director

The Personnel Committee will discuss funding for the Search Firm for Executive Director role.

E. Pinlac shares the proposal, and it is sent to everyone through email. I am impressed by their proposal since they used the flows from our campus which is



known when looked at attention to detail and it shows that this is a good company. The reason why we're going with the firm is to help us solicit more candidates. They are a nationwide based in Massachusetts, but they do searches within the area. If you read the packet, there is a section where they talked about who they are. The firm is committed to diversity, which is why CSU works with them closely. They have listed the ASI's that they have worked with in the past. The Executive Director for SFS State was picked by them. There are CSU and few other public universities which they have worked with. They are well known in the industry, and I have seen emails from them every often. They have talked about pricing in their packet which is about 3rd of salary is and when Martin did the calculation. If we do an estimated salary of \$115k, it comes out to \$37,950. There are some things which they said would be additional some of them we don't need. For example, we don't need to take on background check, we have a background check company that does it for us. We are not far from their minimum which is \$35000. This may seem steep but the next person who will be coming in, is going to be here for the foreseeable future. The firm will bring us in a quality candidate that will be with us for at least next five to 10 years. There are more things on the packet but attention to details of adding our photo into there. I did not realize before that I was working with the President directly, so I don't know the size of the organization. They don't seem big but work nationwide. I propose that we get some of the funding. I will be looking at the area that are underspent. For example, retreat was under spent because we could not go anywhere in person. If we have to pull out of reserves, I believe it should okay as it is one-time expense. I wanted to talk about this with AJ and Kabir about why we should do it. I reached out to and them and want to make sure that everyone is comfortable with taking this route. The firm mentioned that they would check all resumes and sure the candidates are well aware of the range, so it won't cause any problem when the candidate gets hired. When I worked with the firm, we received good list of candidates. Looking at their proposal, I am pleased to see that they work with a lot of CSUs and auxiliaries in particular.

M. Maamou says I want to share my experience. I am on the Provost Search Committee, they went through a firm's early on stage. Similar to what Erik said,



they screen the resumes, organize it, and present it. It is clean and convenient. They are organized and what they do is the definition of.

A. De Leon says I agree with Mirna and it would help with the candidate. Timeline-wise, if you were to move forward, how would that be?

E. Pinlac says they have not included a timeline but the earliest the firm can start is mid to late February. I am hoping that is the prime time for recruitment, for higher education and any education in general. In their policy, the firm has a retention guarantee and off-limits policy. They have a guarantee, if candidate leaves within 12 months then they would waive their fee to bring a new candidate which guarantee getting a candidate. This is an extra assurance for the organization. There are other firms we can look at but they weren't really higher ED instead were executive, CFO and Presidents. This position is similar to Directors Association.

M. Castillo asks can you get a timeline from them before our next so we can start booking time on the calendars? It is to make we're prepared for it instead of doing it last moment.

E. Pinlac will reach out to them today and try to get a timeline or at least a rough timeline so we have an idea about which weeks to start planning for.

K. Dhillon says this discussion will be put on the upcoming meeting agenda for approval of funding.

46:37

E. INFORMATION ITEM: **Director of Sustainability Affairs Vacancy**

The Executive Vice President/Chief of Staff will inform the Personnel Committee of the decision to leave the Director of Sustainability Affairs position vacant for the remainder of the academic year.

K. Dhillon says as of the memo sent out, regrettably Josh was not able to continue in his role. The decision I made in consultation with Erik and AJ was to leave the position vacant for the end of this year because, for one, the capacity of this committee and the availability since we would be the main group that will be interviewing for that position and screening through the applications. Looking at the timeline, it will take one month and the new candidate for this position would be joining in March. At that point we would be halfway through the academic year.



There is no point of appoint someone for one and half month and we also have graduation. I would like to have the next Director of Sustainability to start the role on May 31st.

M. Castillo asks can we see if Tyler will be able to take on the role? I believe April is Sustainability Month or Mother Earth Day, rather than focusing on other programs, if he can focus on that area.

K. Dhillon says Erik and Michael could see if ASI Presents can partner.

E. Pinlac says I can communicate with Michael Ryan on our one on one meeting. I believe there is a budget associated with that which Tyler and the group can do if not then the Senate can use people power there.

K. Dhillon says we will follow up with outside of the meeting. We thought of sustainability while we're leaving the position vacant, we care about it. There is programming which is done on a year by year basis and we can't let that go. Any more discussion?

49:10

F. DISCUSSION ITEM: Vice President of University Affairs Appointment | CLOSED |

The Personnel Committee will discuss interviewed applicants for the Vice President of University Affairs vacancy.

K. Dhillon says there are not any interviewed applicants. We have not interviewed any applicant for the position because the qualification was not met. The position will be on rolling basis until the position has been filled.

Motion to move the discussion item to the next Personnel Committee Meeting by **K. Dhillon**, second by **A. De Leon**, motion **CARRIED**.

49:55

VIII. SPECIAL REPORTS:

No special reports.

50:12

IX. ROUND TABLE REMARKS



E. Pinlac says I want to applaud Michael Ryan and Lauren for keeping up throughout the transition of roles. I encourage everyone to visit University Union. In case you meet Lauren or Michael, let them know that we are noticing their work.

J. Domino says can we determine whether or not should I be present.

K. Dhillon says I will be following up with you outside the meeting and you are welcome to attend the meeting. You will be informed and invited to the meeting regardless of whether there is a sanction or not. The decision to attend is yours.

M. Cesena says I want to invite everyone on the first event for Presents on Friday during lunch time in room UU311 There will be programming rolling out next week, we had been online because of COVID 19. There is going to be free food. It is traditionally super bowl theme, but there were some programming and scheduling issues but definitely invite your friends tell students tell staff team to come.

K. Dhillon thanks them. Congratulations to Michael Ryan and Lauren on their new positions. I am in office today. The glass looks amazing and you can tell where the ASI office is.

52:30

X. ADJOURNMENT at **1:53 PM**

Minutes approved by:

Executive Vice President/Chief of Staff & Chair

Name: Kabir Dhillon


-- ASIExecVP (Feb 9, 2022 13:28 PST)

Minutes approved on:

02-09-2022

Date:








Personnel Committee Meeting Minutes of February 2, 2022.

Final Audit Report

2022-02-09

Created:	2022-02-09
By:	Sneh Sharma (sneh.sharma@csueastbay.edu)
Status:	Signed
Transaction ID:	CBJCHBCAABAAQaqOVAAtVB9VtbBZBITI3E1gjrQC41jqr

"Personnel Committee Meeting Minutes of February 2, 2022." History

-  Document created by Sneh Sharma (sneh.sharma@csueastbay.edu)
2022-02-09 - 9:27:04 PM GMT- IP address: 134.154.131.27
-  Document emailed to -- ASIExecVP (asiexecvp@csueastbay.edu) for signature
2022-02-09 - 9:27:39 PM GMT
-  Email viewed by -- ASIExecVP (asiexecvp@csueastbay.edu)
2022-02-09 - 9:27:59 PM GMT- IP address: 66.249.84.94
-  Document e-signed by -- ASIExecVP (asiexecvp@csueastbay.edu)
Signature Date: 2022-02-09 - 9:28:06 PM GMT - Time Source: server- IP address: 134.154.74.175
-  Agreement completed.
2022-02-09 - 9:28:06 PM GMT