

**Personnel Minutes of April 20, 2022**

- I. CALL TO ORDER at **11:34 AM**
  
- II. ROLL CALL  
**Present:** Kabir Dhillon, Anjelica De Leon, Mirna Maamou, Zaira Perez, Krisstina Caro, Martin Castillo, Erik Pinlac  
  
**Late:** Michael Cesena
  
- III. ACTION ITEM - **Approval of the Agenda**  
**Motion** to approve the agenda of April 20, 2022, by **K. Caro**, second by **M. Maamou**, motion **CARRIED**.
  
- IV. ACTION ITEM - **Approval of the Minutes of April 6, 2022**  
**Motion** to approve the minutes of April 6, 2022, by **M. Maamou**, second by **K. Caro**, motion **CARRIED**.
  
- V. PUBLIC COMMENT – **Public Comment is intended as a time for any member of the public to address the committee on any issues affecting ASI and/or the California State University, East Bay.**  
No public comment.  
**1:21**
  
- VI. UNFINISHED ITEMS:  
No unfinished items.  
**1:24**
  
- VII. NEW BUSINESS ITEMS:
  - A. DISCUSSION ITEM: **Finance Committee Member Removal**  
The Personnel Committee will discuss removing Haris Muhammad from the Finance Committee.  
**M. Maamou** states has been a scheduling issue that the Finance Committee has not been able to meet. This causes delays in the club fundings requests which I am not permitted to process without my committee meeting. It has been a



challenge because the committee joined late in the year to which there was not enough time to train or establish a system to decide on meeting dates. I need to process club funding, and there is no way for me to do that if we are having to cancel meetings last minute. The club funding requests need to be processed immediately. When the Finance Committee is unable to meet, nobody gets blamed but me. When I do not do my job then I am disappointing everybody around me. When I am not completing what I need to complete then Erik is being blamed for it. I am trying to process everything that has been on hold and complete it. It is not personal. If the committee were able to join early in the semester, we would have had a different outcome. I want to point out that I am not taking jobs away from students, because if students want to apply, they would have applied the first semester. We practically told these people that they are joining the Finance Committee which did not work out well.

**K. Dhillon** presents a statement from Haris since he was not able to attend this meeting. My name is Haris Muhammad. I have written a statement due to my inability to attend in person for the Personnel Committee discussing my removal from the Finance Committee. I was excited about taking this role because I am a Finance major and believe that taking this role would be a stepping stone in my career. Due to our schedules not aligning with the work itself that needed to be done as soon as possible, I received an email about being removed from the committee. At first, I was confused and did not put much thought about it. However, it did leave me frustrated because the reason for my removal was lack of performance, which I did take personally even if I was not supposed to. I was there for the VP of Finance and if there is an emergency, I can push back my burdens and be available. I was disappointed with this outcome and if I had not heard from her of what I have to be doing then I would have understood it better rather than getting an invitational email about being removed. The situation was managed unprofessionally. I do not wish to be a part of the committee anymore, although I am thankful to the VP of Finance for giving me this opportunity.

**M. Maamou** points out that this was a miscommunication, Haris received an email before I got the chance to inform him that we are letting go of the committee. I have talked with Haris and explained that it was not personal, I was able to meet with Haris in person to train him. He did let me know that he would be available, but he would text me an hour prior and ask if we can hold a meeting in an hour which is not how it works here. We have to know at least 3 days in advance so I can put out an agenda and announce that we are holding a meeting.



I appreciate that he did put in an effort but every time that I wanted to have a meeting, and I sent it a week in advance they were not able to meet. For example, they would let me know last minute that I can meet during that time, but I cannot put that on agenda. I have not gone through all the steps that I need to take. We had an emergency meeting but for that, I needed 24 hours in advance as a notice. I cannot have an emergency meeting in an hour. If it were that way, this would have been easy. We would meet whenever I ran into him at Starbucks or something but there is a process for everything which held us back. I understand his frustration because he ended up receiving the email, but I did get the chance to talk to him. It was not about his performance because he was extremely helpful, but our schedules did not align.

**M. Castillo** asks why we would be removing people from the committee if it is not working then there are other avenues to get club funding approved. We can have discussions then move up to action for the Board of Directors to decide. There are alternative methods. This has happened before when we have a committee that is not able to convene and do business, so we move that business into a different format. I am curious as to whether anyone had mentioned that was a different way of getting those 25 club funding requests approved.

**M. Maamou** was informed about that approach which I was going to take, but the committee was already planning a meeting, so the approach was not taken. At the last minute, our committee meeting would be canceled, and it was too late for me to add it to the Board of Directors' agenda. It was a repeating thing to where I need to sit down and process the club funding. I will do whatever it takes to do that because we are behind.

**M. Castillo** asks that removing the committee members is not going to expedite the processing of funding. Why this would be the course of action, as opposed to saying, we are not able to meet? What is the rationale to have members removed when we are almost done with the semester?

**M. Maamou** states if there are no committee members then the VP of Finance can approve the club funding as there is no meeting required. I can process the club funding requests and if the club meets the requirements, I approve them.

**M. Castillo** will defer to Erik on procedural grounds, but I was not aware you can meet quorum with three people and that is going to be tough. Unless it is only 2 people then it may seem biased, If it is too big I would say to move forward with business as opposed to this route as this leaves a bad taste in people's mouths, as you can see from that letter. Please correct me if I am wrong, to remove members



from a committee the week before, for you to move forward with the business, there are alternate ways of accomplishing that same goal. I recognize there have been some illnesses, there have been some timing issues and they joined you late. Unless you have decided with what we do with the Board. This is why we tell the Board of Directors to keep noon to 2:00 PM open on Wednesdays, because it is preset. It is hard to set up a meeting in the middle of the semester with students who are the busiest. If we went to vote, that is where my vote would be coming from as well.

**E. Pinlac** states our deadline for club funding was up on April 14th. I believe it because we do not want a month out before the term ends. How many clubs funding requested applications are yet to be processed? Removing them now, does not change the past. If it helps us in the future, then I would say do it. If it does not, then we are wasting our time. That is something we evaluate, depending on how much funding we have and if it benefits us moving forward because the application has been closed for the semester.

**M. Maamou** states there are 15 Club funding requests are waiting to be processed, although we did close applications because of the deadline. Those are time-sensitive because those events that we need to process the funding plan are coming up. It takes time for Sneh's team to set up the spreadsheets and other steps. If a decision is made today, then I can process all the club findings and it would be done. They are not waiting anymore. I believe one of the events is on the coming Saturday and we have not been able to process it. This is why I cannot wait until the next Board meeting because we are out of time. They need to get processed. I understand there will not be any club funding coming in because we close applications but 15 applications are waiting to be processed. There is a cultural graduation celebration that is pending, and they need to be processed.

**A. De Leon** emphasizes Martin's question, if we do not have anyone in the Finance Committee, would that expedite the VP of Finance on being able to process those funding requests?

**E. Pinlac** states if there is no committee seated then the VP of Finance would process the club funding. When our club funding is less dependent on the committee and the only way that we disqualify is if they do not follow the process. It is based on the club funding policy. That is what clarifies it because without a committee, you do not need the different perspectives on approving events. It is just the matter on following the policy.



**M. Maamou** states if we were able to have this committee early on last semester, then it would have been possible because as I am interviewing them, I could have asked them if they would be able to meet every other week. We would have been able to set up a meeting that that is going to happen every other week, one way or another. They joined a couple of weeks ago so there was no time to do that.

**M. Castillo** asks how long have the club funding requests been in there? If they have only been a part of the committee for two weeks and we are operating under the assumption that you do not have a committee who can approve them when they've could have been approved before they have even joined the committee. It does come across, as an outsider looking in, as punishment for not having joined last semester to have set a standard. I would not penalize anybody. If these funding requests were sent to you before you even had the committee then why didn't you move forward? I believe you would have gone to the Executive Committee. From what I have seen, it has been done before, even when we have had your position vacant before, requests go to the Executive Committee as an alternate, then it goes to the Board. If that is even required, you are often able to approve them and move forward without saying anything.

**M. Maamou** says all the funding requests sitting in the inbox had been requested while having the committee. We were able to process a set of 10 fundings before as a committee as I and Haris met up. We have 3 people on our committee, and we need 2 to be within quorum. We were able to process some but that took 3 weeks to be able to schedule a meeting. These funding requests have been in pending for a while now and we are not able to get a meeting to bring them up to the Executive Committee or Board to approve.

**K. Dhillon** states Nolan was appointed on December 14<sup>th</sup>, and Haris was appointed on February 9<sup>th</sup>. Haris mentioned that he does not wish to be a part of the committee. I believe at this point it would be approving the resignation letter in this case. Are there any questions or comments?

17:39

**B. DISCUSSION ITEM: Finance Committee Member Removal**

The Personnel Committee will discuss removing Nolan Calara from the Finance Committee.

**M. Maamou** states that our struggles have not aligned, and he has not been able to make it to any of the meetings. Even if I gave him time and I tried to work around my schedule, but I have tight schedules which I can only try so much. I





could not let Haris and Nolan meet because they are not comfortable with the BaySync and how to go through them. I had to explain the policy as we are approving them and go through it.

**N. Calara** agrees that this is professional. I wanted to be on the Finance Committee. A few reasons are because I am an Accounting major and try to take as many opportunities as I can to gain experience in finance. I want to learn how to deal with this and be encourage instead of feeling discouraged from being involved in ASI in the future. I have been transparent as I have given the reasons why I cannot make it to meetings. In addition, I have tried to offer solutions due to my lack of availability during those times. I have been replying to emails as I get them. I do not want to sit down and watch an opportunity such as being removed from the Finance Committee being taken away due to my lack of last-minute availability, lack of transparency, and professionalism that come from this committee. With all due respect, I appreciate everything that the VP of Finance has done but the committee keeps on consisting of last-minute meetings and rarely any email replies. I wish that this committee had more transparency, and I do have emails to provide why that it is transparent. I feel there needs to be effective communication, instead of email replies with no responses.

**M. Maamou** states I understand I did ask for last-minute meetings but when that did not work and other alternatives that were given more time, those did not work, and the solutions that I was given to not being able to attend those meetings were times of 6:00 PM. I do not have it in me to work after 6:00 PM.

**M. Castillo** states it is difficult to recognize that he is not available because he has been in my office and we are working with James on Student Sexual Assault Awareness. I have seen him there for hours at a time. I am not aware where that communication goes since it could be a conflict with schedules. It may lead to a recommendation that the committee applications state I am available during this time in which the meetings are set and so nobody runs into this. It is a matter of personal scheduling than it is about the work not getting done.

**N. Calara** states while reading the emails. Mirna responded at 12:35 AM and I responded back at 12:07 PM. She responded on April 11<sup>th</sup> on 10:53 AM, and I responded two minutes later, informing her that I was not available at that time and if there was any way that we could reschedule. Instead of an email reply, I get an invite to this Personnel Committee to be removed.

**K. Dhillon** asks for clarification purposes, when did you begin working?



**N. Calara** answers I started working with James and Martin. With me and James, we were able to exchange our availability and we were able to let him know that I was available for that time. I have been responsive to his emails, and I was able to collaborate with him.

**K. Dhillon** asks when did you begin working in that office? I am curious if there was an overlap with the Finance Committee when they started meeting.

**N. Calara** answers he has not been officially working and is based on meetings in preparation for Sexual Assault Awareness Month.

**M. Castillo** asks if Nolan is working with an ASI Senator?

**N. Calara** started working in late January with James.

**M. Castillo** clarifies those hours are after Mirna because they are there late.

**K. Dhillon** states from the discussion, that there are many concerns about scheduling. I agree with Martin's suggestion about having a set time when those meetings are going to be happening. Executive Vice President, Arazeli, and I had a chance to speak about these concerns. She can hear some of the concerns today and I can forward recommendations that this committee has to the next Personnel Committee. I believe when planning about both semesters, opportunities to meet during university hours because unless you have many of those opportunities. Those time slots are created depending on the individual members.

**M. Maamou** points out that she has been under pressure from Sneh's team because they prepare those applications, send them to me, and need me to process them. They need me to process them quickly because they need to make the spreadsheets and other documents on their end. I am expected to be available whenever there are funding requests, which is unrealistic. I am not holding anyone accountable, not even for their performance because I have not gotten the chance to see that performance. This is a matter of schedules not aligning, there are plenty of requests that need to be processed. I am the one who gets in trouble for not getting them processed. I am exhausted from all of this. My boundaries have been violated a lot. My number is being given out to club members to contact me, which I believe is absolutely not okay.

**K. Dhillon** states this role has been overwhelming and there are many deadlines. Schedules did not align with the situation. While it is a wonderful opportunity to bring on it but sometimes that happens.

27:09

VIII. SPECIAL REPORTS:



No special reports.

**27:13**

**IX. ROUND TABLE REMARKS**

No roundtable remarks.


**27:29**

**X. ADJOURNMENT at 12:01 PM**

Minutes reviewed by:

**Executive Vice President/Chief of Staff & Chair**

Name: Kabir Dhillon

  
-- ASIEExecVP (May 3, 2022 13:22 PDT)

Minutes approved on:

**04-27-2022**

Date:

