

**Appendix A: TEMPLATE FOR ANNUAL PROGRAM REPORT REVIEW** (*See preceding document for detailed descriptions for each section*)

**ANNUAL PROGRAM REPORT**

College	College of Education and Allied Studies
Department	Hospitality, Recreation and Tourism
Program	M.S. in Hospitality, Recreation and Tourism
Reporting for Academic Year	2018-19
Last 5-Year Review	2014-15 (for AY 2009-2014)
Next 5-Year Review	2020-21 (for AY 2015-2020)
Department Chair	Dr. Chris Chamberlain
Author of Review	Dr. Nancy White
Date Submitted	10/1/19

**SELF-STUDY** (*suggested length of 1-2 pages*)

**A. Five-Year Review Planning Goals**

*Present your planning goals from your last 5-year plan.*

1. Increase student participation through outreach, recruitment and marketing.
2. Refine classes and curriculum through analysis and improvement of teaching methodology.
3. Improve collaboration with industry partners.
4. Obtain and fill new faculty positions, reaching a level of full staffing for all major areas of concentration.
5. Increase transferability from California Community Colleges.

**B. Progress Toward Five-Year Review Planning Goals**

*Report on your progress toward achievement of the 5-Year Plan. Include discussion of problems reaching each goal, revised goals, and any new initiatives taken with respect to each goal.*

Goal	Progress
Increase student participation through outreach, recruitment and marketing	<p>Faculty members actively participate in promotional events and make presentations both on and off campus to promote the program, including Graduate Fairs, orientations, transfer days, preview day, Al Fresco, high school visits and more. The Hospitality, Recreation and Tourism Career Fair, organized by Dr. Vilhauer with assistance from department faculty, is a popular event for both employers and students. A number of hotels, event planning companies, recreation organizations and other HRT businesses participate in the Career Fair. The event is held on campus in the Fall and Spring semesters. Students and alumni have opportunities to apply for internships and paid employment opportunities, and to network with industry professionals at the Career Fair.</p> <p>The department continues to work on updating the website and establishing a social media presence through Facebook, YouTube and LinkedIn. Marketing and promotional materials featuring the new department logo continue to be developed, including banners, posters and signs for use at trade shows and events. The new department logo was created to improve brand recognition and to promote each different aspect of the department. Hospitality is symbolized with a pineapple, recreation with a pine tree, recreation therapy with a</p>

	<p>symbol of figures participating in recreation, and tourism with a cruise ship.</p> <p>REC University (REC U) workshops designed for professionals in the recreation field are offered a few times each term. The opportunity to earn CEUs, learn new skills, expand knowledge and network is appreciated by industry professionals. The department hosts a table in the exhibit hall at the California Parks and Recreation Conference (CPRS) every year, to recruit industry professionals interested in furthering their education and careers. REC U and tabling at CPRS are good ways to attract new graduate students, as the audiences are industry professionals seeking career advancement at both venues.</p>
Refine classes and curriculum through analysis and improvement of teaching methodology	<p>After implementation of newly designed semester classes in Fall 2018, the faculty continue to discuss areas where further refinement is needed. Most classes in the program are now 8-weeks in length, with the exception of the two capstone courses. Student feedback will be sought in Spring 2020 about course length, content and sequencing. The new sequence of classes is designed to improve student preparation for the capstone courses. Starting with REC 600, students learn about foundations of the professions and theories. In REC 630, students focus on research methods and writing the Applied Research Project Proposal. REC 693A involves further development of the first three chapters of the Applied Research Project, Institutional Review approval for human subject research and pilot testing of the survey or interview questions. In REC 693B, students collect and analyze data, and write the final two chapters. Feedback from industry professionals and alumni who make up the HRT Advisory Committee continues to be valuable in terms of developing and revising curriculum.</p>
Improve collaboration with industry partners	<p>Regular meetings of the HRT Advisory Committee feature discussions between alumni, representatives from industry, students and faculty members. This collaboration has resulted in valuable suggestions to improve student success, HRT classes and programs. Faculty also connect with industry partners throughout the Bay Area to market our programs, place students in internships, volunteer and paid positions. The HRT Career Fair, sponsored by the department twice a year, is one example of department collaboration with industry partners. The event is an effective way to connect employers with our students, and provides benefits to the industry, our program, students and alumni.</p>
Obtain and fill new faculty positions, reach a level of full staffing for all major areas of emphasis	<p>In Spring 2019 there were 10 full-time tenured or tenure track HRT faculty, 4 in Hospitality and Tourism (Hallab, Padron, Ann, and Yilmaz), 5 in Recreation (Chamberlain, Fortune, Vilhauer, White, and Yates), and 1 in Recreation Therapy (Kong). HRT has a number of strong lecturers, with professional work experience in the industry. For the 2018-19 academic year there were 5 lecturers in Hospitality, 6 in Recreation and 1 in Recreation Therapy. Searches are being conducted in 2019-20 to fill two new tenure-track positions, 1 in Hospitality/Tourism and 1 in Recreation. Additional tenure-track faculty positions are needed to improve the ratio of tenure/tenure track to lecturer and assure each program area is fully staffed.</p>

### **C. Program Changes and Needs**

*Report on changes and emerging needs not already discussed above. Include any changes related to SB1440, significant events which have occurred or are imminent, program demand projections, notable changes in resources, retirements/new hires, curricular changes, honors received, etc., and their implications for attaining program goals. Organize your discussion using the following subheadings.*

**Overview:** The faculty continue to work together to design courses and promote excellence in teaching. Collaboration between department faculty related to course content, assessment of student learning outcomes and possible improvements will continue. Ongoing recruitment efforts are necessary to maintain the number of students in the program at a sustainable level, while strengthening the applicant review process to assure students accepted have the skills and experience needed to succeed in the program. Relationships with industry professionals are continually built through collaborations and networking events, including the Career Fair and HRT Advisory Committee.

**Curriculum:** A few of the new classes in the graduate program will be offered for the first time in the 2019-20 academic year. New classes were added to the program based on research of other graduate programs and input from industry professionals. Faculty feel that the inclusion of classes on law and risk, marketing and fiscal management are essential for preparing students for management positions in industry. A student survey related to class length, content and sequencing of classes will be conducted at the end of Spring 2020 to determine if further curriculum revisions are needed.

**Students:** Students in the program are diverse and the majority work full-time in a hospitality, recreation and tourism industry while going to school. Total enrollment was slightly lower in 2018-19, which is a result of the change to semesters and also more stringent review of applicants. In order to improve student success in the program, applicants are evaluated based on a series of criteria including GPA, writing skill and industry experience/knowledge.

**Faculty:** Department faculty meet frequently to evaluate and discuss our students, programs, curriculum, marketing and goals for the future. In addition to working with students to coordinate events, present research projects, and attend professional meetings and conferences, faculty members participate in planning retreats, monthly meetings, working meetings and recruitment events. Faculty actively work to improve the quality of our programs and classes, work with industry partners and market our programs. Faculty members present regularly at conferences, publish papers and book chapters, and serve in leadership positions on regional/national committees and boards. HRT faculty members are actively engaged in department, college and university committees. The newly created HRT Center for Professional Excellence was approved at the end of the academic year. This University Center is designed to promote training and education. A number of department faculty are serving on the Board of Directors.

**Staff:** HRT shares 2.5 office staff and 2.5 academic advisors with the Department of Kinesiology.

**Resources:** (*facilities, space, equipment, etc.*) Office space was obtained, starting in Fall 2018 in Arts and Education for a faculty member previously housed in Robinson Hall and also for a tenure track faculty member previously housed in a shared lecturer office. Two to three more offices in Arts and Education are needed for the new faculty members being hired for 2020-21, and also for a tenure-track faculty member currently sharing an office space with a number of lecturers.

A shared office space for hospitality and tourism lecturers is needed, as the shared office space currently used by a tenure-track faculty member and lecturers in recreation has reached maximum capacity. A space reserved for use by the student club and for students to meet has been one of the goals for the department for many years. Through A2E2 funding, the department continues to obtain equipment necessary for students to obtain hands-on experience in the provision of special events. A refrigerator,

microwave, portable oven, serving dishes, wine glasses, tables and chairs were purchased over the past few years. Equipment still needed includes a freezer, dishwasher and working sink. Secure storage space for the special event equipment and for set-up/clean-up is a continuing priority.

**Assessment:** Faculty members are revising the map of semester courses that will be assessed to determine if program and course learning outcomes are being met, along with signature assignments for each course. The department will use ILO rubrics developed by East Bay faculty, and approved by the Senate, for assessment of both undergraduate and graduate courses. This year, department faculty members provided assignments in their classes to be assessed at the program and ILO level. The department schedule of assessment for the next few years which will correspond with ILO assessment being done at the University level.

**Other:** (*e.g., major program modifications*) In addition to offering new classes in law and risk, marketing and fiscal management, the length of classes in the program was modified starting in Fall 2018. Most of the classes, with the exception of the two capstone courses, are 8-weeks in length. One 8-week class is offered in the first half of each semester and another is offered the second half. Although it is challenging to complete a 3-unit class in 8 weeks, it provides more concentrated focus on one subject.

## **I. SUMMARY OF ASSESSMENT (*suggested length of 1-2 pages*)**

### **A. Program Learning Outcomes (PLO)**

*List all your PLO in this box. Indicate for each PLO its alignment with one or more institutional learning outcomes (ILO). For example: "PLO 1. Apply advanced computer science theory to computation problems (ILO 2 & 6)."*

Students who graduate with an M.S. in Hospitality, Recreation and Tourism will be able to:

1. Apply evidence-based research to generate effective, sustainable solutions related to management of personnel, facilities, operations, marketing and finance in hospitality, recreation and tourism (ILO 1 & 4).
2. Assess exemplary and innovative management, leadership and teamwork strategies for hospitality, recreation and tourism organizations (ILO 5).
3. Articulate clearly, in both written and oral formats, the foundations of the hospitality, recreation and tourism professions in terms of theory, philosophy, administrative functions and current management practices (ILO 2 & 6).
4. Develop a systems approach to create and sustain a culture of dignity and respect among individuals, communities, organizations and hospitality, recreation and tourism industries (ILO 3).

### **B. Program Learning Outcome(S) Assessed**

*List the PLO(s) assessed. Provide a brief background on your program's history of assessing the PLO(s) (e.g., annually, first time, part of other assessments, etc.).*

Apply evidence-based research to generate effective, sustainable solutions related to management of personnel, facilities, operations, marketing and finance in hospitality, recreation and tourism (ILO 1: Written Communication).

### **C. Summary of Assessment Process**

*Summarize your assessment process briefly using the following sub-headings.*

**Instrument(s):** (*include if new or old instrument, how developed, description of content*). The ILO Written Communication Rubric was used.

**Sampling Procedure:** The signature assignment from one section of REC 630, a required class in the

program was assessed.

**Sample Characteristics:** All of the students in the class were majors in the graduate program.

**Data Collection:** (*include when, who, and how collected*). A total of 10 Applied Research Project Proposals were selected from Blackboard assignments in Spring 2019.

**Data Analysis:**

Rubric Criteria	Scores (n=10)				Mean
	4	3	2	1	
Statement of Purpose	4	6	0	0	3.4
Audience Awareness	7	3	0	0	3.7
Organization, Cohesion and Clarity	3	7	0	0	3.3
Presentation of Supporting Ideas	9	1	0	0	3.9
Language Usage, Sentence Structure	4	6	0	0	3.4
Mechanics, Grammar, Punctuation, Spelling	6	4	0	0	3.6

**Summary of Assessment Results**

*Summarize your assessment results briefly using the following sub-headings.*

**Main Findings:** The mean score of student work was at or above the competent rubric score of 3.0 for all six of the criterion; purpose, audience, organization, supporting ideas, language and mechanics. The highest rated item was presentation of supporting ideas. Ratings were lowest for organization.

**Recommendations for Program Improvement:** (*changes in course content, course sequence, student advising*). More emphasis on development of writing skills throughout the curriculum would benefit graduate students. Providing more opportunities for students to read, write and receive constructive feedback are all ways to improve writing skills. Peer reviews are helpful, but many writing errors are not corrected through the process of peer review. The practice of submitting a draft, and receiving both peer review and instructor feedback prior to resubmission is a good way to improve student writing - as long as the feedback is used by students to improve the work.

**Next Step(s) for Closing the Loop:** (*recommendations to address findings, how & when*). Faculty should provide clear expectations for written communication in class assignments, along with tips about how to improve writing skills (answers to frequently asked questions, templates, use of spell and grammar check, and encouraging the use of resources such as the Student Center for Academic Achievement and the Online Writing Lab). Students will be required to find good examples of dissertations and theses early in the program so they can begin to learn more about how to format and organize their Applied Research Projects, write a descriptive purpose statement, craft solid research questions and design the methodology for their studies.

**Other Reflections:** Increasing the number of faculty members involved in the assessment process, and the number of student artifacts being assessed will provide more useful data in the future.

#### **D. Assessment Plans for Next Year**

*Summarize your assessment plans for the next year, including the PLO(s) you plan to assess, any revisions to the program assessment plan presented in your last five-year plan self-study, and any other relevant information.*

Program assessment will be based on the plan for ILO assessment at the University level for upcoming years. The PLO for Critical Thinking will be assessed for 2019-20. The goal will be to use Blackboard Outcomes to obtain a random sample of student work in at least two classes, and for a group of two or more faculty members to complete the assessment.

II.

### **DISCUSSION OF PROGRAM DATA & RESOURCE REQUESTS** (*suggested length of 2 pages*)

*Each program should provide a one-page discussion of the program data available through University Dashboard. This discussion should include an analysis of trends and areas of concern. Programs should also include in this discussion requests for additional resources including space and tenure-track hires. Resource requests must be supported by reference to University Dashboard data. Requests for tenure-track hires should indicate the area and rank that the program is requesting to hire. If a program is not requesting resources in that year, indicate that no resources are requested.*

#### **A. Discussion of Trends & Reflections**

##### **Notable Trends:**

*Summarize and discuss any notable trends occurring in your program over the past 3-5 years based on program statistics (1-2 paragraphs). You may include 1-2 pages of supplemental information as appendices to this report (e.g., graphs and tables).*

The program continues to attract students working full-time in the hospitality, recreation and tourism industries who are seeking career advancement. Good avenues for recruiting new students to the program include REC U (a series of CEU workshops for recreation professionals) and tabling in the Exhibit Hall at the California Parks and Recreation Annual Conference. The overall number of students in the program has slightly decreased in the past 5 years, which coincides with an effort by faculty to uphold higher standards for admission to the program. Students with good writing skills and industry knowledge/experience are better prepared to handle the demands of the program. Recruitment efforts need to be increased to attract qualified candidates for the graduate program.

##### **Reflections on Trends and Program Statistics:**

*Provide your reflections on the trends discussed above and statistics and supplemental information presented in this report.*

Marketing the program through events like REC U, the California Parks and Recreation Society Conference, Graduate and Career Fairs has helped to increase the visibility of the program. The fairly consistent number of students in the program reflects the demand in the industry. The long-term goal is to continue to maintain or slightly increase enrollment. Factors that result in fluctuations in enrollment include changes in compensation in the industry, employers who do not require advanced degrees for some positions, and unemployment levels.

#### **A. Request for Resources** (*suggested length of 1 page*)

##### **1. Request for Tenure-Track Hires:**

Additional tenure track faculty need to be hired in the upcoming years in order to improve the ratio between tenure/tenure track and lecturers, and to assure each program area is covered. Although the number of tenure track hires has increased in the past 10 years, an imbalance remains. The goal is to reach a level of 60% tenure/tenure track to 40% lecturers. The current proportion in the department is 43% tenure/tenure track to 57% lecturers. Improving the diversity of the faculty to better match the student population is another goal of the department, and is an important consideration for faculty searches. Two tenure-track searches are in progress now, one for Hospitality/Tourism and one for Recreation. The start date for the new faculty members is Fall 2020.

##### **2. Request for Other Resources**

The HRT Department has been sharing office staff and academic advisors with the Kinesiology Department for a number of years. The department faculty have been discussing the desire to move away from this shared arrangement, to streamline and improve operations. A full-time academic advisor for the Department of Hospitality, Recreation and Tourism was requested in the past, with no shared responsibility for advising students from other departments. A search is being conducted to replace one department academic advisor, who is now serving CEAS as an advisor for the entire college.

**Offices, storage, equipment:** Office space was obtained, starting in Fall 2018 in Arts and Education for a faculty member previously housed in Robinson Hall and a tenure track faculty member previously housed in a shared lecturer office. A shared office space for hospitality and tourism lecturers is needed, as the shared office space currently used by a tenure-track faculty member and lecturers in recreation has reached maximum capacity. A space reserved for use by the student club and for students to meet has been one of the goals for the department for many years.

Through A2E2 funding, the department continues to obtain equipment necessary for students to obtain hands-on experience in the provision of special events. A refrigerator, microwave, portable oven, serving dishes, wine glasses, tables and chairs were purchased over the past few years. Equipment still needed includes a freezer, dishwasher and working sink. Secure storage space for the special event equipment and for set-up/clean-up is a continuing priority.

**APR Data from Pioneer Insights**  
**M.S. in Hospitality, Recreation and Tourism**

Table 1

Hospitality, Recreation and Tourism Graduate Students by Gender

	Fall 2014		Fall 2015		Fall 2016		Fall 2017		Fall 2018	
	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%
Female	27	75%	23	66%	21	68%	20	69%	13	52%
Male	9	25%	12	34%	10	32%	9	31%	12	48%
Total	36	100%	35	100%	31	100%	29	100%	25	100%

Table 2

Hospitality, Recreation and Tourism Graduate Students by Race/Ethnicity

	Fall 2014		Fall 2015		Fall 2016		Fall 2017		Fall 2018	
	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%
American Indian	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%
Asian	4	11%	5	14%	6	19%	6	21%	3	12%
Black/African American	6	17%	6	17%	6	19%	8	28%	7	28%
Hawaiian/PI	0	0%	1	3%	1	3%	0	0%	0	0%
Hispanic/Latino	5	14%	9	26%	11	35%	4	14%	3	12%
International	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%
Multiple races	4	11%	3	9%	2	6%	2	7%	2	8%
Unknown	3	8%	3	9%	1	3%	2	7%	3	12%
White	14	39%	8	23%	4	13%	7	24%	7	28%
Total	36	100%	35	100%	39	100%	29	100%	25	100%

Table 3

Hospitality, Recreation and Tourism Graduate Students – First Generation

	Fall 2014		Fall 2015		Fall 2016		Fall 2017		Fall 2018	
	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%
First generation	23	64%	20	57%	22	71%	14	48%	4	16%
Non-first generation	13	36%	15	43%	9	29%	15	52%	21	84%
Total	36	100%	35	100%	31	100%	29	100%	25	100%

Table 4

HRT Headcount Proportion by Instructor Over Time

	Fall 2014		Fall 2015		Fall 2016		Fall 2017		Fall 2018	
	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%
Regular faculty	7	28%	8	31%	10	36%	10	34%	10	43%
Lecturer	18	72%	18	69%	18	64%	19	66%	13	57%
Total	25	100%	26	100%	28	100%	29	100%	23	100%

**Table 5****HRT Instructor Category and Rank Summary**

		Fall 2014		Fall 2015		Fall 2016		Fall 2017		Fall 2018	
Rank		n	FTE								
Assistant Professor		1.00	1.00	2.00	2.00	4.00	4.00	4.00	4.00	5.00	5.00
Associate Professor		2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	1.00	1.00
Professor		4.00	4.00	4.00	3.38	4.00	3.38	4.00	3.38	4.00	4.00
Total Regular Faculty		7.00	7.00	8.00	7.38	10.00	9.38	10.00	9.38	10.00	10.00
Lecturer		18.00	12.36	18.00	11.57	18.00	11.17	19.00	11.20	13.00	8.57
Total		25.00	19.36	26.00	18.59	28.00	20.55	29.00	20.58	23.00	18.57

**Table 6****HRT Faculty by Gender**

	Fall 2014		Fall 2015		Fall 2016		Fall 2017		Fall 2018	
	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%
Female	11	50%	12	52%	13	50%	15	56%	12	55%
Male	11	50%	11	48%	13	50%	12	44%	10	45%
Total	22	100%	23	100%	26	100%	27	100%	22	100%

**Table 7****HRT Instructor Race and Ethnicity**

	Fall 2014		Fall 2015		Fall 2016		Fall 2017		Fall 2018	
	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%
Asian	2	9%	2	9%	3	12%	3	11%	3	14%
Black/African American	3	14%	3	13%	3	12%	3	11%	3	14%
Hispanic/Latino	2	9%	2	9%	2	8%	3	11%	2	9%
International	0	0%	1	4%	2	8%	1	4%	1	5%
Unknown	1	5%	1	4%	1	4%	1	4%	1	5%
White	14	64%	14	61%	15	58%	16	59%	12	55%
Total	22	100%	23	100%	26	100%	27	100%	22	100%

**Table 8****CEAS FTEs, FTEf and SFR**

Department	Fall 2016			Fall 2017			Fall 2018		
	FTEs	FTEf	SFR	FTEs	FTEf	SFR	FTEs	FTEf	SFR
EDLD	151.5	6.7	22.5	143	6.3	22.8	104.9	5.7	18.5
EDUI	30	1.2	25.7	19.4	1.1	18.2	26.3	1.1	23.2
EPSY	263.1	13.1	20.2	276.7	13.2	21	231.4	12.7	18.3
HRT	519	18.2	28.5	498.4	18.6	26.8	412.1	15.5	26.6
KPE	596.6	27.4	21.8	631.6	28.1	22.5	582.1	26.0	22.4
TED	265.2	9.1	29.2	266.2	8.5	31.2	223.8	7.5	29.8
Total	1825.4	75.6	24.1	1844.7	76	24.3	1580.6	68.5	23.1