

Team _____

Reviewer _____

Evaluation Form

The East Bay Historia

Title of Essay: _____

1) Reviewer's Recommendation

_____ I recommend for publication without substantial changes

_____ I recommend for publication with the revisions suggested below

_____ I recommend that the author be asked to make the revisions suggested below and resubmit the manuscript again next year

_____ I do not recommend that this article be published in *The East Bay Historia*.

Use this form to write comments, criticisms, and suggestions that can be sent to the author.

Do not sign your name.

2) Please comment on the following points. Please note: these comments will be passed along anonymously to the author. To help the author with revisions, please reference the page numbers from the manuscript if you are suggesting certain revisions. These comments will guide the author with revisions, so please provide as much detail as possible.

- a) Does the paper bring an original, insightful concept or viewpoint?
- b) What is the thesis? Is the thesis clear and concise?
- c) Does the introduction grab your attention while offering historical context?
- d) Is the structure, organization, and flow cohesive?
- e) Does the author provide sufficient and credible evidence to support the thesis? Does the author critically analyze their sources?

Additional Comments: